TAYR Quarterly (ISSN 2382-2872. Impact Factor 0.805) is an indexed journal that publishes all kinds of scientific research in English Language Literature, and Civilization conducted by young researchers from all over the globe. All articles, Research Letters, and papers published are reviewed by a committee of young researchers in the first phase and then edited by an eminent researcher. TAYR Quarterly is totally free and open access to all TAYR members.

TAYR Quarterly (TQ), a professional journal, encourages submission of previously unpublished articles on topics of significance to individuals concerned with English language teaching, learning, and research.

As a publication that represents a variety of cross-disciplinary interests, both theoretical and practical, TQ invites manuscripts on a wide range of topics, especially in the following areas:
- psychology and sociology of language learning and teaching
- issues in research and research methodology
- testing and evaluation
- professional preparation
- curriculum design and development
- instructional methods, materials, and techniques
- language planning professional standards

Because TQ is committed to publishing manuscripts that contribute to bridging theory and practice in our profession, it particularly welcomes submissions that address the implications and applications of research in, for example,
- anthropology
- applied and theoretical linguistics
- communication
- education
- English education, including reading and writing theory
- psycholinguistics
- psychology
- first and second language acquisition
- sociolinguistics
- sociology
TAYR QUARTERLY

TAYR Quarterly Board

Guest Editor:
Prof. Chokri Smaouii

Editor-in-Chief:
Dr. Mimoun Melliti

Editorial Board:
Dr. Yosra Amraoui
Dr. Ikram ben Arfi
Dr. Nadia Konstantini
Dr. Farhat Ben Amor

Reviewers:
A committee of young researchers specialized in different fields. More information concerning their expertise is available at www.tayrweb.org/#!/c3qn
Author Guidelines
All submissions to TQ should conform to the requirements of the Modern Language Association (MLA) or the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.), which can be obtained from the American Psychological Association. Per APA 6th edition, please note that DOIs are required in references and can be obtained at http://www.crossref.org/guestquery/. TQ prefers that all submissions be written in a style that is accessible to a broad readership, including those individuals who may not be familiar with the subject matter.
TQ solicits manuscripts in four categories: Full-Length Articles, Research Letters (Brief Reports and Summaries), Research Issues, and Book Reviews. For the necessary submission items and other requirements, please see the category below for the article you intend to submit. Prospective authors are encouraged to read articles from the section to which they intend to submit to get an idea of the style and level of research required for publication.
TQ does not accept paper submissions. To submit you need to send a pdf version of your article to Moun Melliti tayr.tayr@gmail.com If a paper has more than one author, the person submitting the manuscript will have to identify the corresponding author and add the other authors. If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com. To facilitate the double-blind review process, please remove the author’s name from the main text, the in-text citations, the reference list, and any running heads. Please replace the author’s name with Author. If there are multiple authors, please use Author1, Author2, etc. Manuscripts submitted without author’s name(s) removed will be returned without review for alteration and resubmission.
It is understood that manuscripts submitted to TQ have not been previously published and are not under consideration for publication elsewhere. It is the author’s responsibility to indicate to the editor the existence of any work already published (or under consideration for publication elsewhere) by the author(s) that is similar in content to the submitted manuscript. It is also the author’s responsibility to secure permission to reprint tables or figures that are used or adapted in the manuscript from another source. Written permission from the copyright holder is required before TAYR can publish the material. For more information on copyright permissions, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com. The TQ editor reserves the right to make editorial changes in any manuscript accepted for publication to enhance clarity, concision, or style. The author will be consulted only if the editing has been substantial. The views expressed by contributors to TAYR Quarterly do not necessarily reflect those of the TQ editors, the Editorial Advisory Board, or TAYR committee members. Material published in TQ should not be construed as having the endorsement of TAYR. All TQ authors may obtain a free final PDF offprint of their article--once the article has published online. When evaluating a manuscript for publication in TQ, reviewers consider the following factors:
• The manuscript appeals to the general interests of TQ’s readership.
• The manuscript elucidates the relationship between theory and practice: Practical articles must be anchored in theory, and theoretical articles and reports of research must contain a discussion of implications or applications for practice.
Guidelines for submission

• The content of the manuscript is accessible not only to specialists in the area addressed but also to TQ's broad readership.
• The manuscript offers a new, original insight or interpretation and not just a restatement of others' ideas and views.
• The manuscript makes a significant (practical, useful, plausible) contribution to the field.
• The manuscript is likely to arouse readers' interest.
• The manuscript reflects sound scholarship and research design with appropriate, correctly interpreted references to other authors and works.
• The manuscript is well written and organized and conforms to the specifications of the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.).

For accepted TQ papers, authors have the option of recording a short video abstract that will be accessible to readers via TAYR website and Facebook group. The article will retain its text abstract, but the video abstract will add another dimension and draw readers into an article in a new way.

TQ encourages authors to consider uploading their data collection materials to specialist repositories and databases and either citing or linking back to the primary research article. For example, IRIS is an online repository for data collection materials used for second language research. This includes data elicitation instruments such as interview and observation schedules, language tests and stimuli, pictures, questionnaires, software scripts, url links, word lists, teaching intervention activities, amongst many other types of materials used to elicit data. Please see http://www.iris-database.org for more information and to upload.

Any questions may be addressed to iris@iris-database.org.

Submission categories:

Full-Length Articles

Full length articles typically present empirical research and analyze original data that the author has obtained using sound research methods. TQ publishes both quantitative and qualitative studies. Occasionally, this section features reflective articles (i.e., think pieces) that provide a comprehensive review of current knowledge in a specific area and present significant new directions for research.

Manuscripts should be no more than 8,500 words, including reference, notes, and tables. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the article.

To submit a manuscript for a full-length article, please send a Word version of it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document to tayr.tayr@gmail.com:

• names and contact info for all authors
• cover letter
• abstract (200 words)
• manuscript (8,500 words)
• tables
• figures
• acknowledgments (if any)
T A Y R
QUARTERLY

Guidelines for submission

If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

Forum
TQ publishes four types of articles in the Forum:
• Commentaries from readers regarding current trends and practices in the English language research
• Responses to articles and reviews published in TQ
• Brief discussion of qualitative and quantitative research issues
• Brief discussions of teaching issues
Commentaries submitted to the Forum should generally be no longer than 3,400 words. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript.
Responses to articles should be no more than 1,500 words. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript. The article will be given to the author of the original article or review before publication for a reply that will be published with the response article. Unfortunately, TQ is unable to publish responses to previous exchanges.
To submit a manuscript to the Forum section, please send it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

Research Letters
TQ also invites Research Letters (short reports) on any aspect of English research theory and practice. The editors encourage manuscripts that either present preliminary findings or focus on some aspect of a larger study. In all cases, the discussion of issues should be supported by empirical evidence, collected through qualitative or quantitative investigations. Research letters or summaries should present key concepts and results in a manner accessible to our diverse readership.
Submissions to this section should be no more than 3,400 words (including references, notes, and tables). Please indicate the number of words at the end of the research letter. Longer articles do not appear in this section and should be submitted to the full-length articles section.
To submit a manuscript to the Research Letters section, please send your work to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document:
• names and contact info for all authors
• cover letter
• manuscript (3,400 words for commentary; 1,500 words for a response)
• author bio(s)
• acknowledgments (if any)
If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.
Guidelines for submission

• acknowledgments (if any)
If you have questions about the submission process, please send an email to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

Research and Teaching Issues
Contributions to Research Issues and Teaching Issues are typically solicited. The editors pose a question concerning a salient issue in research or teaching and invite someone in the field to write an answer. Readers may send topic suggestions or make known their availability as contributors by writing directly to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.
Contributions to Research or Teaching Issues should be no more than 3,400 words, including tables, figures, and notes, and references. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript.
If you have been invited to submit a manuscript, send it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.
To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document to tayr.tayr@gmail.com:
• names and contact info for all authors
• cover letter
• manuscript (3,400 words)
• tables
• figures
• author bio(s)
• acknowledgments (if any)
If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com
TAYR QUARTERLY

Volume 4, Issue 1, March 2017

Guest Editor:
Prof. Chokri Smaoui

Editor-in-Chief:
Dr. Mimoun Melliti

Editorial Board:
Dr. Yosra Amraoui
Dr. Ikram Ben Arfi
Dr. Nadia Konstantini
Dr. Farhat Ben Amor
Table of Contents

- An evaluation of published papers and final Master’s degree dissertations
  By Athina BOUKHELOUF; Khadidja-Samira ZITOUNI; Djelloul NEDJAI (Doctoral students, Batna -2 University, Algeria); Pr. Mohammed-Salah NEDJAI (Head of the Scientific Board, Faculty of Foreign Languages; Former Rector of Batna University, Algeria) …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………10

- A pragmatic perspective on the U.S. print media coverage of the tunisian revolution: The construction of evaluation through reference
  By Boutheina Hammami………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………22

- Identification of Japanese religious immigration in contemporary canadian minorities’ literature
  By Sawssen Ahmadi …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………48

- Ditransitive voice in medical and sociological academic articles
  By Sabiha Choura …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………65

- Modality as a convincing Strategy for Political Power Abuse: Tony Blair’s speech on the Iraqi crisis as a case study
  By Sihem Aoididi…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………86

- Re-thinking Religious Text Translation: A Conceptual Framework for an Interdisciplinary Translation of the Qur’an
  By Mhammed Krifa…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………119
An evaluation of published papers and final Master's degree dissertations

By Athina BOUKHELOUF; Khadidja-Samira ZITOUNI; Djelloul NEDJAI (Doctoral students, Batna -2 University, Algeria); Pr. Mohammed-Salah NEDJAI (Head of the Scientific Board, Faculty of Foreign Languages; Former Rector of Batna University, Algeria)

Introduction

Writing is a skill that is required in many contexts throughout life. It is an essential skill for success in the modern world. Therefore, without a good knowledge of academic writing, a career of a researcher would be somehow limited. Nowadays, “there is a growing awareness that learners need to develop proficiency not only in the more frequently emphasised skills of speaking, listening, and reading, but in writing as well” (Jacobs et al, 1981, p. v).

The process of writing, in general, refers to a method applied in order to represent a certain language in a visual form. In other words, it is the symbolic representation of speech. This means “originating and creating a unique verbal construct that is graphically recorded” (Emig, 1977, p.5). Ultimately, the writing process is not a naturally acquired skill. It is either learned or culturally transmitted whether in formal instructional settings or in other contexts (Burns and Sinfield, 2008). According to Emig (1977), “it is not linear in nature but recursive, a loop rather than a straight line” (p.93).

It would be wrong to perceive academic writing as a simple activity. Rather, it is a complex process (Archibald & Jeffry, 2000; Chamot, 2005). Actually, it enables writers not only to explore thoughts and ideas but to think as well (Ghaith, Shaaban & Harkous,
Next to that, it necessitates the use of skills, steps, writing style, line of inquiry, wide range of vocabulary and so on. Accordingly, many psychologists state that writing shows evidence of reflective thinking in academic context (Burns and Seinfeld 2008). Crowhurst (1988) believes that writing refers to “the thinking process that goes on during writing” (p. 7). Besides, it encourages “a set of skills which must be practiced and learned through practice” (Grabe and Kaplan, 1996, p. 6).

Interest in the process of academic writing has continued to date as the last decade has witnessed an increased number of academic published papers, articles and dissertations. From above, an inevitable question has to be asked: do all academic published works follow the scientific protocol relevant to the norms of the academic writing?

Therefore, in the present study, we tend to examine the existence of the basic norms that are required in any academic writing. Some of these norms consist of the presence of the needed skills, expertise of the writer, line of inquiry, steps of writing, applying the appropriate style of writing, coherence and cohesion, objectives, sets and objectives achieved, application of the right referencing style, the link between the title and the content, the link between the abstract and the content and, most importantly, avoidance of plagiarism.

1. Skills of academic writing

Learning to write well is arguably a complex task. This is why Shimozaki (1988), for instance, argues that “writing is one of the most difficult skills to attain” (p. 137). For academic writers, developing the skills of writing is an essential tool in their career. Thus, mastering writing skills means to be proficient in dealing with grammar, vocabulary, and punctuation. It involves, at least, the ability to distinguish between main and controlling ideas, what a paragraph should contain, or how to start or conclude it.

2. Writer's expertise

Through time and experience, a good writer acquires the needed knowledge and skills to fulfill his task efficiently and proficiently. This expertise serves the writer whenever he encounters impasses. It provides the ability to quickly recognise and work
around constraints. Frequently, writers rely on past experiences and previously acquired specific knowledge to move forward toward a satisfactory output of the item writing assignment. Hence, academic writing with expertise has revealed the presence of frequent combinations of problem definition, exploration, evaluation, and solution as the writer moves through the problem space toward the completion of the item writing assignment.

3. Line of inquiry

Through the line of inquiry, it is only by taking the needed time to thoroughly investigate and interrogate a topic through dedicated inquiry that a given edited paper can be considered as an academic piece of writing. Consequently, a sound line of inquiry stands as a prerequisite to achieve a successful academic work. Kuklthau, Maniotes & Caspari (2007) describe the line of inquiry in the process of writing as an activity which:

“requires more than simply answering questions or getting a right answer. It espouses investigation, exploration, search, quest, research, pursuit, and study. It is enhanced by involvement with a community of learners, each learning from the other in social interaction” (p. 2).

Furthermore, inquiry considers ideas to be placed at the centre (Scardamalia, 2002). The spirit of inquiry is achieved by welcoming ideas and trusting that even the simplest questions can lead to something greater and not yet evident.

4. Steps of writing

The following major steps of writing have to be strictly followed:

• prewriting (brainstorming to get ideas),
• discovery drafting (putting ideas on paper),
• revising (adjusting, adding, or deleting ideas),
• editing and proofreading (looking at the fine points), and
• publishing (presenting your work in its final form).

5. Style of academic writing

The main goal of academic writing is to present and evaluate academic issues and to arrive at conclusions resulting from research, rather than from one's own personal
biases or opinions. Hence, there are appropriate reasons to consider the needed style for this process. Firstly, it is important to keep the writing process clear and concise. In addition, writers have to make sure that their ideas appear in a clear expression and comprehensible form. This means that sentences should be complete and ideas arranged into paragraphs or sections. Next, a wide range of vocabulary is needed in addition to the ability to use it properly. The academic writing style should, as well, undergo perfection in grammar and spelling. On the top of that, writers have to be objective rather than subjective. Thus, it is preferable to avoid personal language. Finally, while writing, writers should consistently base their writing on evidence from the source reading and reference it correctly.

6. Coherence and cohesion

Coherence and cohesion are other key elements of any successful academic paper. Indeed, they improve both form and content of the work. Coherence refers to the overall sense of unity, including both the main point of each sentence and of each paragraph. On the other hand, cohesion refers to how the idea moves through a passage, with each sentence connecting to the previous one and the one that follows.

Unlike cohesion which means the connection of ideas at the sentence level, coherence means the connection of ideas at the idea level. Cohesion mainly focuses on the “grammatical” aspects of writing. In academic research, for instance, writing is considered cohesive when one sentence sticks to the next and one paragraph relates to the next. Writing is coherent when all of the sentences in a paragraph provide new information which turn around a single topic or idea (Williams and Colomb, 2012).

7. Referencing style

Referencing is an important part of the writing process. It is a specific format for presenting and acknowledging the influence of other researchers on the sources of information. In other words, it is the action of mentioning, or alluding to, something. When writing an academic paper, whenever the writer uses ideas, quotes, fact or piece of information from an external source, he has to indicate the source of that information by including where and how he found that piece of information.

For instance, a referencing system covers two elements which consist of citation and reference. Citation means the partial reference in the main body of the assignment
also called in-text citations whereas reference means the full source details as they would appear in the list of references at the end of an assignment, also called reference lists or bibliographies.

There is a wide range of referencing styles, each with different origins and features, depending on the discipline or university the writer belongs to. Thus, it is important that the writing process follows the norms and measures of the referencing style used.

8. Abstract

Almost all scientific papers contain an abstract. The abstract provides an insight on the essential parts and summarises all the work. However, failing in presenting the abstract means failing in the work as a whole. A typical abstract has to be consistent with the title and the content. Hence, the quality of the abstract determines whether or not anybody actually reads the content. Furthermore, the abstract must include the needed information relevant to the content of the study so that it can be evaluated. It must comply with the paper contents, objectives, method and results. Finally, discussion must be consistent and appropriately organised.

9. Avoidance of plagiarism

Any scientific writer is menaced to become too obsessed with certain information to the point of copying word for word from the original text without referring to its source. Plagiarism is well pointed to by June (2009) who argues that it is “the unacknowledged use of another person’s work or ideas, whether intentionally or unintentionally, and is a form of intellectual theft” (p.2). Hence, in any scientific paper, the most important point is to clearly show the understanding of the subject and the ability to manipulate information to define or complete a specific task.

In our attempt to answer the question concerning researchers’ competence in writing, we have evaluated thirty (30) research papers published in Algerian national and international scientific revues and thirty (30) final Master’s degree dissertations in English language and literature.

Methodology
A 10-item grid of evaluation has been used to see to which extent each of the principles highlighted in our overview of literature is taken into account. Also, whenever one principle is used, we have attempted to evaluate its degree of use according to a 5-point likert scale which appears in the grid of evaluation presented below.

**Grid of evaluation:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items of academic writing</th>
<th>Very poor</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Very good</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Skills of writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Experience/expertise</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Steps of writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Writing style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Coherence and cohesion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Sets and objectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Referencing style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Link between title and content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Link between abstract and content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Avoidance of plagiarism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Findings and discussion**

**Item 1: Skills of writing**

Grammar, spelling mistakes, punctuation and the overuse of repetitions and redundancies are the most common and recurrent weaknesses that appear in almost all published papers and Master's degree dissertations. These fundamentals and basics of
the English language are less respected, however, in Master’s degree dissertations than in papers published in national and international reviews. When comparing the two texts, we counted fifty percent (50%) more mistakes in dissertations than in published papers. One way to explain this difference is that dissertations are written by young students whereas published papers are the product of teachers. In addition to that, a final dissertation is, to most students, the first experience in writing a long academic text.

**Item 2:** Experience and expertise

Obviously, writers with a long experience possess a better expertise in writing for academic purposes. Actually, articles are mainly published by teachers of English as a foreign language among whom many are teachers of written expression and supervisors of Master students. This is, we believe, what has resulted in a drastic difference in language expertise between published papers and dissertations. In fact, twenty five of the thirty final dissertations we have evaluated clearly point to a writing style of inexperienced writers. Quite interestingly, the five remaining dissertations are written by former teachers of English with more than five-year experience, and who were granted a two-year leave to prepare a university Master’s degree.

**Item 3:** Steps of writing

Among the steps we have mentioned in our literature review, we were surprised by the excessive number of writing mistakes in grammar, spelling, punctuation and capitalisation which could have been easily avoided thanks to revising and proofreading the text. These mistakes are to be found in both published papers and dissertations. If some refer to them as typing mistakes, we rather view them as a lack of motivation in making the needed effort to write better. Indeed, writers have many ways to avoid these mistakes and errors by using appropriate tools or by asking others to proofread the text. Strangely enough, final dissertations are supervised by experienced teachers and published papers are meant to be evaluated and assessed by two or three external experts. What is even more astonishing is that weaknesses in style, for instance, do appear at an unacceptable degree not only in English but in French and Arabic, as well. This is what we have mainly noticed in the translation of abstracts from one language to the other.
Item 4: Writing style

Aspects of the writing style like simplicity, directness, clarity, exactness, induction and deduction are totally absent in almost all published papers and dissertations. In fact, scientific and rigorous reasoning is merely used in these texts. This is why, and due to these weaknesses, published papers and dissertations we have evaluated contain too much vagueness. In many cases we were obliged to spend much time to guess the point the writer is trying to make. On the top of that, the situation is aggravated by the use of too long sentences which add vagueness to the text. It is quite rare to encounter a text which nicely and easily reads from the beginning to the end. The lack of linkage, structure and coherence in the text leads authors of published papers and final dissertations to draw conclusions out of nowhere and to state the evidence instead of attempting an analysis supported by findings and results. This results in a dramatic confusion between personal opinions and beliefs and what research results suggest. We believe that this problem relates more to the writers’ capacity to think critically, to reason and to draw and deduce conclusions, more than to his linguistic abilities.

Item 5: Coherence and cohesion

We have already highlighted the significance of coherence and cohesion as they improve content and form. All papers and dissertations lack satisfactory coherence that results in a good cohesion. Ideas discussed are not nicely linked one to the other. Nor are the different words in each sentence structured around one strong verb to produce a striking and captivating argument to support and reinforce the point the author is making. In addition to that, paragraphs which are supposed to discuss one idea each contain many disparate ideas which make the text vague, confusing and ununderstandable. Consequently, the reader finds it difficult to relate each idea to the main issue. Weakly structured sentences and paragraphs contain neither coherence nor cohesion.

While reading the papers and the dissertations we have evaluated, we never ceased asking the following questions:

- What is the point the author is trying to make?
- How many ideas the author is discussing?
In which section of the work should this issue/idea/element be included?

The lack of linkers and connectors between sentences and paragraphs has resulted in the failure to produce unity in the text. This has, in turn, negatively impacted the whole quality of the text. Due to these causes, the text becomes painful to read and inconsistent.

**Item 6: Sets and objectives**

Academic people decide to do things because they have sets and objectives. Ultimately, published papers and dissertations should contain objectives clearly stated either in the abstract or in the introduction. Accordingly, each author is supposed to target these objectives and to try to achieve them through the use of an appropriate methodology and line of inquiry. Unfortunately, only twelve writers of final dissertations have succeeded in attaining the objectives they have previously set whereas eighteen either had no clear objectives right at the beginning or failed to achieve them. On the other hand, published papers contain more clearly set and nicely achieved objectives. As a matter of fact, twenty-four among thirty writers managed to use a sound line of inquiry to attain the objectives of their papers. Again, experience in writing has certainly helped much.

**Item 7: Referencing styles**

Quite similarly, the difference between final dissertations and published papers is striking. Actually, only a few published papers contain some misuses that directly concern the referencing style used. In contrast, final dissertations neither contain the use of one selected appropriate referencing style nor any conformity to one referencing style. One explanation is that papers meant for publication must inevitably fulfill the requirements of all the norms of the review before they can have final approval for publication. Contrary to published papers, final Master’s degree dissertations need only the supervisor’s approval. In addition, papers published in Algerian national reviews present more misuses in referencing than international ones. Obviously, these differences can be explained in terms of reviews standards. To support this view, we have had a look at some papers published in international reviews cross-world to confirm that the quality of publications is highly tide up with the standards of reviews.

**Item 8: Link between title and content**
This is one of the major difficulties encountered by our students. Indeed, no single final dissertation contains a direct clear link between what the student has decided to do in his title and what he actually did in the written text. They first think of something and end up with something totally different. This complex relation between thinking and writing is an issue that certainly needs further research. As we know some of the thirty students whose dissertations have been evaluated, we have asked them to tell us what is it that they have decided to investigate. We were surprised to confirm that no one of them had a clear perception of his topic. This methodological aspect deserves a paramount attention on behalf of teachers. In fact, newcomers into writing for academic purposes do need much practice to gain the needed experience and expertise before they start writing their final dissertations.

Unlike final dissertations, published papers do not contain the same weaknesses. Once again, before one can publish his academic work, he is asked to rewrite his text according to the comments and suggestions of two or three experts. Obviously, this is what helps each author to refine his text.

**Item 9:** Link between abstract and content

Although item nine is much similar to item eight, we have deliberately added it just to confirm the variable that explains the difference between published papers and final dissertations. Indeed, abstracts contain more soundness and are more coherent with the content of the text and the title for they have been written by teachers who are more experienced writers than students.

**Item 10:** Avoidance of plagiarism

Excerpts of published papers and final dissertations have been checked by a specialised software named “Grammarly checker”. Results obtained show that final dissertations contain excessive plagiarism whereas it is insignificant in published papers. Obviously, students do not use software checkers as much as teachers do.

**Conclusion**

Through the present study, it is clearly demonstrated that academic writing is more successful in published papers than in Master's degree dissertations. This difference is due to the fact that the former are written by teachers who have more
experience than the latter edited by inexperienced students. Furthermore, the objectives and the conditions of writing differ. Actually, in published papers, the writer is more committed, whereas in final dissertations, students are asked to write their final dissertations as a partial fulfillment to graduate. The motivation and the competence at work differ, too.

Among the major recommendations we can make, we would like to stress the necessity to train students more, through regular practice to gain the needed expertise to fulfill the requirements of writing for academic purposes. Next to that, experts who provide approval for publication and supervisors should be more demanding.

References


A Pragmatic Perspective on the U.S. Print Media Coverage of the Tunisian Revolution: The Construction of Evaluation through Reference

By Boutheina Hammami

Abstract

Though its names may change with changing perceptions and insights, the Jasmine/Dignity/Cactus Revolution’s overall impact is so solid, cumulative, and intense that it defies any shaking or destabilizing force. This unprecedentedly massive popular movement in Tunisia ignited interest in the research topic to be developed in the scope of this paper. More specifically, the work intends to explore how latent ideologies and hidden agendas can be tacitly projected through U.S. print newspapers’ account of the Tunisian Revolution.

The focal argument of the present study is grounded on the premise that words are not transparent labels that people stick to things. In view of this, different “wordings” reflect different perceptions of the external world. As such, reference, being the manifestation of how language relates to the extra-linguistic world, is the major pragmatic theoretical model which is utilized in order to account for the mechanisms through which referential strategies can be deployed to communicate media producers’ attitudes about depicted events, entities, and propositions. This linguistic identification of evaluation is tackled at the level of lexis through recourse...
to the sociolinguistic framework of "power" and "solidarity" as well as an originally semantic concept with a pragmatic effect, namely connotation.

To meet these research objectives, the current paper puts under scrutiny data consisting of 18 articles on the Tunisian Revolution published in *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times* from 12th to 17th January, 2011. Results revealed that the naming system is pragmatically-grounded, given that it is being manipulated in accordance with the subtle attitudes of the two newspapers, with more salience of asymmetrical referential practices in *The Wall Street Journal*. The work’s implications touch upon the persistence of the traditional role of the mass media as the mouthpiece of the discourse of existing power-holders as well as the intriguingly manipulative potential of media language.

**Keywords:** Tunisian Revolution, U.S. print newspapers, media language, manipulation, evaluation, reference, power, solidarity, connotation.

U.S. media have been fiercely criticized for the quantity and quality of coverage allocated to the Tunisian Revolution, compared to other events like Iran's Green Movement. This attitude is thought to echo the U.S. government’s critical stance on the ongoing events in Tunisia, seeing that it plainly voiced its support for the Tunisian people only when it was almost obvious that Ben Ali’s regime was doomed to falling apart.

In view of this, the present paper proposes that the U.S. print media attitude to the Tunisian uprising is likely to be reflected in language in terms of their evaluation of President Ben Ali. The framework of evaluation is thus utilized in order to unveil how lexical choices are not a neutral decision but rather do carry implications of approval or disapproval. In other words, reference is argued to be a crucial index of positive or negative evaluation and thus of the changing attitudes of U.S. newspapers which are thought to be encoded in differential referential practices in designating Ben Ali.
The main cause of this expected disparity in portrayal is thought to be the historical event of Ben Ali’s ouster, considering its profound national and international political implications. Indeed, January 14, 2011 marked the beginning of a new social, economic, and political phase in the history of Tunisia; an era in which Ben Ali’s regime ended while anti-government figures gained more momentum and made their voices heard.

Theoretical Overview

This part offers a brief overview of the key issues and concepts which are central to the discussion of the argument developed throughout this paper. Though basically informative in its intent, this overview is far from being exhaustive and is mainly intended to be selective.

Tunisia’s Uprising and U.S. Media Coverage

The Tunisian Revolution, being a form of civil resistance, manifested itself mainly in a wave of street demonstrations which ultimately led to the ousting of a dictator who ruled Tunisia for 23 years with an iron fist. Although the Tunisian uprising was initially sparked by Mohamed Bouazizi’s dramatic and shocking self-immolation out of wrath and despair, it was essentially fueled by young Tunisians’ pent up pains and frustration from their miserable living conditions, unemployment, corruption, injustice, marginalization, and repression. All these grievances led to an unprecedented massive public outrage in Tunisia which was a source of inspiration for similar protests chiefly in Egypt, Libya, Syria, Bahrain, and Yemen.

Surprisingly, this event did not receive the expected international regular and in-depth news reporting that it evidently deserves. Actually, the mainstream international media were criticized for their notable silence and lack of coverage of the "Jasmine Revolution". The U.S. media, particularly, came under harsh criticism for showing little concern and support for the Tunisian people especially at the beginning of the protests. The coming illustrations will reveal that there is a kind of shared perception among a number of media practitioners, well-known bloggers, and experts in Africa and the Middle East affairs that the protests in Tunisia generated less U.S. media coverage and attention than expected, taking into consideration the scale, gravity, and potential implications of the event.
Octavia Nasr, a former CNN senior editor for the Middle East, for instance, confirms that events in Tunisia initially gained little notice outside Tunisia and were overlooked by U.S. media. “For four weeks, Tunisia was ignored in our media .... They didn’t pay attention to the story until it was so huge and in their face” (Gentile, 2011), said Octavia Nasr in an interview. Moreover, she wonders how American media missed such a significant geopolitical event as Tunisia’s uprising, plainly asserting that U.S. media tuned in just when Ben Ali’s government was about to fall and they thus failed to capture the anatomy of the Tunisian Revolution as it unfolded.

A similar argument is advanced by Juan Cole who declared in an interview posted on the popular American blog Crooks and Liars that the Tunisian Revolution was ignored by American corporate media and that one could hardly “find out what was going on in Tunisia from … American mass media.” (Cole, 2011). Relatedly, in an article entitled “U.S. on wrong end of Tunisia’s revolution,” James Gundun contends that “Tunisia’s revolutionary train has departed” and “Washington has missed this freedom train.” (Gundun, 2011). Therefore, the “U.S. claim that America supports all peoples’ aspirations for freedom” (ibid) came too late.

Generally speaking, it seems that the U.S. media scenario as regards Tunisia’s uprising is not quite different from that of the U.S. government. Indeed, once Ben Ali had fled the country, President Obama made a statement on events in Tunisia, applauding the courage and dignity of the Tunisian people and condemning the government’s use of violence (LeVine, 2011). In addition, it was only on January 25, 2011, during the State of the Union Address, that President Obama delivered his memorable statement in clear support of Tunisians: “The United States of America stands with the people of Tunisia and supports the democratic aspirations of all people.” (U.S. Embassy Tunis, 2011, p. 14). Thus, the U.S. media just echoed their government’s critically cautious attitude towards the Tunisian Revolution. Interestingly, the question arises as to the hidden agenda of the U.S. behind such a stance.

James Gundun, for example, attributes this to the fact that the U.S. has always nursed such dictatorial regimes as the ones found in Tunisia, Egypt, and Yemen merely because their leaders are loyal allies of the United States in its fight against
terrorism and extremist Islamic groups like Al-Qaeda (Gundun, 2011). Indeed, the U.S. government reacted to the Jasmine Revolution with caution and continued to voice support for Ben Ali until the end of his rule for fear of losing a long-time ally in the struggle for rooting out anti-American Islamic groups. Another explanation is offered by Juan Cole who argues that American corporate media did not give the needed coverage for the Tunisian Revolution because it is a revolution made by workers and that “had this been a revolution led by the Muslim party … it would have been 24/7 coverage.” (Cole, 2011).

Briefly, the aforementioned interpretations and explanations serve to support the focal argument of this paper, being how the mass media have always been used as a manipulative tool to infiltrate the hidden agendas and latent attitudes of the dominant bloc into the mass audiences.

**Manipulation and Media Language**

Mey (1993) defines linguistic manipulation as “the successful hiding of societal oppression by means of language” (p. 296), foregrounding the negative overtones with which the term is generally associated. A more precise definition is offered by Van Dijk (2008) who stipulates that manipulation is “a communicative and interactional practice, in which a manipulator exercises control over other people .... More specifically, manipulation implies the exercise of a form of illegitimate influence by means of discourse.” (p. 212). He cites the mass media as an example of a contemporary form of communicative manipulation which is multimodal, as media producers deploy language, image, sound, moving picture, and so forth to manipulate the “minds” of their audiences (Van Dijk, 2008, p. 211). In a similar vein, Bednarek (2006) concedes that the “media-whether newspapers, the radio, the internet, or the TV-arguably influence to a great extent how we view and think of the world we live in” (p. 187). As a matter of fact, media discourse is a typically fertile field for manipulation. Given that the data to be explored in the present work is exclusively written (as opposed to pictorial, audio-visual ...), light is then mostly shed on linguistic manipulation in print media.

Manipulation in the discourse of print media is closely tied to the issue of bias. Indeed, “accusations of newspaper bias are almost as old as the press itself” (Stewart
et al., 2001, p. 425). Bias can be defined as the act of “favouring one side or viewpoint over another” (ibid). It can take a variety of forms among which is selectivity, that is, the practice of reporting facts and events that are in harmony with the medium’s underlying ideology and attitudes while opposing opinions and events are left out (Stewart et al., 2001). As such, the coverage of the full spectrum of opinions is seldom possible across the mass media.

Although audiences have the power to decipher media messages from their own perspective, producers are claimed to be more powerful in that they can still set their agendas in very subtle ways (ibid). Accordingly, media messages are wittingly “injected into the minds of the masses … in the form of changes in attitudes and behavior” (Balnaves et al., 2009, p. 58) and their impact is seldom avoidable. However, the identification of media producers is not that straightforward. Fairclough (1989) argues that the producer in print media, for instance, cannot be specifically identified as a journalist or even as an editorial board. These producers are rather represented by a much more comprehensive and sophisticated institution led by existing power-holders who determine from which angle of telling the newspaper is to report different events and stories. As such, the media are thought to be utilized as a means of manipulation for “the expression and reproduction of the power of the dominant class and bloc” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 51).

The fact that media discourse involves participants who are separated in place and time adds to the intricacy of the issue of manipulation in this discourse. As a matter of fact, this one-sidedness makes mass media a very special form of communication in that “the nature of the power relations is often not clear … involving hidden relations of power” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 49). Media producers, being one participant, can exercise power on audiences by having the ultimate say over what is to be included and excluded, how events are depicted, and how people and entities are referred to (Fairclough, 1989).

**Reference, Wording, and Naming**

As far as the present work is concerned, the intention is not to review the vast body of literature on reference as a philosophical concept (e.g. Kripke, 1980) but mainly to adopt a pragmatic approach to the issue for the sake of relevance and
conciseness. Reference is defined as “the means by which a speaker utters a linguistic expression in the expectation that it will enable his addressee to infer correctly what entity, property, relation, event, or the like he is talking about” (Green, 1989, p. 37). There are three ways available to the speaker/writer to designate a given referent: description (e.g. woman, house, dog...), pointing (this woman, those people...), and naming (Mary, Mike...). The bracketed words whose function is to designate a given referent, be it a person, object, or place, are called referring expressions (Cruse, 2004).

The inferencing mechanism that enables addressees to find out what referring expressions designate in the real world is “not strictly semantic or truth-conditional, but involves the cooperative exploitation of supposed mutual knowledge” (Green, 1989, p. 47). In other words, selectional choices made by the addressee at the level of referent terms are not only governed by logic, or how to make the addressee efficiently pick out the intended referent, but also determined by the addressee’s hidden intentions and perception of the referent.

In a similar vein, Mey (1993) devotes a section entitled “wording the world” (p. 300) to stress the idea that “words are not just labels we stick on things” (p. 301), as people are able to interact with their environment and realize a kind of awareness of it through the wording process. It follows that the “available wordings shape our perception of our environment” (Mey, 1993, p. 302) and their choice is influenced by “the context of our lives” (Mey, 1993, p. 302). In view of this, the relation which holds between the world, on the one hand, and the word, on the other hand, is claimed to be “dialectical” (Mey, 1993, p. 303) and, by implication, language cannot be viewed as the mere reflection of reality. Instead, the referential choices that people make to relate to the external world and make it more accessible to them reflect their subjective perception and understanding of reality.

Media producers are no exception and they can even be described as expert users of wordings, especially that, as argued in the previous section, their discourse is constructed and so far from being natural. This idea is well elaborated by Fairclough (1989) who argues that the press has a kind of “hidden power” (p. 52) which operates through the subtle favoring of certain wordings that essentially mirror the point of
view of the power-holders in a given society rather than that of the newspaper, as it may seem.

Equally central to the discussion of manipulation in the mass media is the process of naming, which is narrower in scope than “wording” and which makes part of the more comprehensive notion of reference (e.g. Simpson, 1993; Wilson, 1990; Ervin-Tripp, 1972). Wilson’s (1990) study, for instance, capitalizes on self-referential naming strategies by unveiling the pragmatic grounding in politicians’ selectional choices in parliamentary debates. Said differently, these politicians managed to “manipulate the hearer’s identification by directing attention away from designated individuals towards some generic role” (Wilson, 1990, p. 77) like presidency.

Of most relevance to the argument developed throughout this paper is the work of Simpson (1993) who puts under scrutiny third-person naming techniques characteristic of newspaper accounts of political events. His analytical approach is based on the premise that media discourse primarily relies on a kind of interaction between producers and receivers, albeit the natural and spontaneous feedback typical of face-to-face interaction is missing. Still, the one-sided aspect of media discourse should not be taken as a counter-argument to this conception, seeing that “all discourse producers must produce with some interpreter in mind [and] what media producers do is address an ideal subject” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 49), that is, a prototypical receiver.

It follows that terms of address which are conventionally used to account for the type of social relationships between speakers in face-to-face interaction like power, formality, and social distance, can be equally utilized to tackle media written texts. This is the focal point of Simpson’s (1993) study in which he reveals that the six examined newspapers reported the same event from different angles of telling through detecting an asymmetrical naming paradigm in their act of referring to certain politicians. As the present work investigates third-person naming strategies in U.S. print news media, Simpson’s approach is thought to be of crucial relevance and is thus adopted in the analysis of the collected data. As such, a more detailed account of address forms is deemed to be enlightening at this stage.

A Sociolinguistic Account of Address Forms
Proper names are traditionally prime examples of linguistic expressions with a clear reference (Mey, 1993). Albeit the process of inferencing on the part of the addressee in this case may not be as demanding and challenging as it is with other types of referring expressions, the use of proper names to designate referents cannot be claimed to be devoid of speakers’ intentions and may still project their perceptions of the person referred to or addressed directly. As a matter of fact, the rich literature on proper names, used as vocatives in sociolinguistics, has unveiled the ways in which they can play the role of linguistic signals of "power" and "solidarity" relations between speakers in face-to-face speech exchanges (e.g. Brown & Ford, 1961; Brown & Gilman, 1960; Brown & Levinson, 1987; Ervin-Tripp, 1972; Holmes, 2001, amongst others).

It is to be noted, however, that the use of proper names, or more generally address forms, to mark the power-solidarity contrast should not be confined to direct speech interactions but can be extended to cover how a person is referred to, seeing that the rules governing the usage of proper names in address and reference are roughly the same (Hudson, 2001). Even studies which attempted to cast doubt on this argument (e.g. Dickey, 1997) ended up with very little and weak evidence. This last point is of paramount importance to the present work which intends to explore the pattern of reference terms used to refer to Ben Ali in the collected corpus of U.S. print newspapers, with a view to detecting the power-solidarity relations which hold between writer and referent and their evaluative implications.

While European languages such as French have pronominal address forms which can signal "power" and "solidarity" relations known as the T/V distinctions, in English such a variation in terms of address is mainly nominal. Indeed, in face-to-face interactions, English speakers can choose specific naming variants from a multitude of available address terms which range from first name FN (e.g. Jack, Thomas, Fred), last name LN (e.g. Smith, Brown), title T (e.g. Doctor, Mr., Sir), to other combinations like TLN (e.g. Mr. Brown) and FNLN (e.g. Deborah Smith). The choice of one linguistic marker rather than another is tied to the type of social relation between speaker and addressee in terms of the power-solidarity contrast (Wardhaugh, 1986).
The pioneering works of Brown and Gilman (1960) on second-person pronominal address forms and Brown and Ford (1961) on nominal terms of address as well as the subsequent contribution made by Ervin-Tripp (1972) have made the concepts of "power" and "solidarity" central to the sociolinguistic account of address forms. Whereas power is characteristic of a nonreciprocal naming pattern, solidarity is associated with reciprocal forms of address. Thus, power is an indication of asymmetrical relations between a subordinate and a superior while solidarity is typical of symmetrical relationships between equals in terms of various aspectssuch as occupation rank, age, friendship, and family bonds (Tannen, 1990).

The use of title (T) alone as a linguistic marker of address, for example, is considered to be the least intimate way of addressing someone, for titles are devoid of any personal aspect and give the impression of formality. It follows that the choice of TLN as an address form is more intimate and less formal than the T alternative. In a similar vein, the FN option would act as a strong indication of intimacy while the use of FNLN renders the social relationship between interactants more formal and less intimate (Wardhaugh, 1986). Different factors come into play in determining how the speaker would position himself/herself vis-à-vis his/her addressee on the power versus solidarity scale. These include the particular occasion, social status, sex, age, family relationships, and occupational hierarchy (Wardhaugh, 1986). As far as the current work is concerned, the choice of the reference term is argued to be associated with the variable of evaluation, that is, the extent to which the referent is positively or negatively perceived by the newspaper.

**Evaluative Lexis and Connotation**

Hunston and Thompson (1999) define evaluation as a broad cover term which has to do with “the expression of the speaker’s or writer’s attitude or stance towards viewpoints on, or feelings about the entities or propositions that he or she is talking about” (p. 5). The act of evaluation lays bare not only the writer’s attitude but also the underlying ideology of the society lying behind the production of a given text. Manipulation is a paramount feature of evaluation, as writers have subtle ways of persuading readers of seeing things from a particular perspective and, consequently, “expressing something as a problem ... makes it difficult for the reader not to accept it.
as such” (Hoey, 1983, p. 95). Hunston and Thompson (1999) outline three main aspects of the linguistic identification of evaluation, namely lexis, grammar, and text. Actually, the first aspect is deemed to be the most relevant one for the present study which puts under scrutiny linguistic items which are isolated from their immediate linguistic context, though by no means from their larger generic, political, and ideological context.

As regards evaluative lexis, Hunston and Thompson (1999) suggest that a number of lexical items are inherently evaluative like the noun “jams” (p. 1) which can be semantically decomposed into “a lot of traffic” + “bad” (p. 1). As a matter of fact, some nouns and adjectives are used not only to describe people, entities, and situations, but also to imply approval or disapproval. Based on their analysis of a corpus taken from the Collins Cobuild English Dictionary, they reached the conclusion that most of the time there exist two words in the English language which denote almost the same information but signal two different attitudes. For instance, “rebels” and “malcontents” (p. 17) both express a kind of dislike for the current system; however, the choice of the second term implies an additional meaning of disapproval of such an attitude.

Hunston and Thompson (1999) relate the act of evaluation to three main concepts, namely connotation (Lyons 1977), affect, (Besnier, 1993), and attitude (Halliday, 1994). Light is then shed mainly on the first concept, seeing that it is more adaptable to the analysis of isolated linguistic expressions, as it is the case for this paper. Lyons (1977) argues that the connotation of a word is “an emotive or affective component additional to its central meaning” (p. 176). The central meaning here refers to what semioticians call denotation, distinguishing between two types of “signifieds”: denotative signified and connotative signified (Chandler, 1994). While denotation designates the literal and commonsense meaning of a sign, connotation refers to the personal, cultural, emotive, and ideological associations of the sign.

Determining the connotation of a lexical item thus entails the search for its semantic meaning in an English dictionary where such additional features as pejorative or disapproving can be added to the lexical entry of a word carrying negative connotations. However, this is thought not to be exhaustive especially in
light of the view that probing into the meaning of a word demands a consideration of its semantic or literal function as well as its pragmatic force (Channell, 1999), that is, what it is intended to mean by its user on a particular occasion.

This view of the concept of connotation is thoroughly discussed by Allan (2007) who puts forward that the “connotations of a language expression are pragmatic effects that arise from encyclopaedic knowledge about its denotation (or reference) and also from experiences, beliefs, and prejudices about the contexts in which the expression is typically used” (p. 1047). Said differently, identifying the connotation of a term necessarily entails an identification of the community attitude towards it. For example, this is true of the use of words like “Mike” and “Michael” which can have the same referent but probably not the same connotations (Allan, 2007, p. 1047).

The analysis of reference terms in the current study is intended to reflect a similar view of connotation, seeing that an account of the semantic meaning of the isolated referring expressions alone can fail to grasp their underlying evaluative intent and evidently needs to be complemented by a pragmatic dimension capitalizing on the newspaper’s subtle intention behind opting for particular linguistic choices.

Methodology

The methodology section is meant to provide a description of the data, the collection process, and the analytical procedure used in the investigation of the collected articles.

Data Description and Collection

The data under scrutiny in the present work is made up of 18 articles retrieved from two of the top three newspapers in the United States by daily circulation for the six-month period ending on March 31, 2011.¹ In fact, all of the three top rated daily newspapers—The Wall Street Journal, USA Today, and The New York Times—were initially included in the search for the needed articles. Surprisingly, however, USA Today which ranks second on the list, issued only one article which fits the selection criteria set by this study. This detail may be reminiscent of the idea developed earlier about the scarcity of the U.S. news reporting of Tunisia’s uprising. As such, eight

¹ These figures are compiled by the Audit Bureau of Circulations
articles published in *The Wall Street Journal* (WSJ) were ultimately compiled from the Factiva database and the remaining ten appeared in *The New York Times* (NYT) and were retrieved from the Lexis-Nexis.com database. Table 1 provides a wider range of details about the data.

**Table 1**

**Description of the newspaper articles**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>NEWSPAPER</th>
<th>HEADLINE</th>
<th>WRITER(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY 13, 2011</td>
<td>WSJ</td>
<td>Tunisian Protests Stoke Concern in Arab World</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>Tunisia Seethes</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Protests Spread to Tunisia’s Capital, and a Curfew Is Decreed</td>
<td>David D. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY 14, 2011</td>
<td>WSJ</td>
<td>Tunisia Leader Makes Concessions Amid Strife</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>Tunisian Leader Shaken as Riots Hit Rich Hamlet</td>
<td>David D. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY 15, 2011</td>
<td>WSJ</td>
<td>Revolt in Tunisia</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tunisians Oust President—US Applauds Change of Power; Rare Popular Uprising is Shock to Arab World</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>As Tunisia Events Play out Live, The Middle East Watches Warily</td>
<td>• Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Summer Said</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Jay Solomon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>Arab Nations’ Jubilation at an Ouster Serves as a Potent Lesson for Their Leaders</td>
<td>Anthony Shadid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>President of Tunisia Flees, Capitulating to Protesters</td>
<td>David D. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY 16, 2011</td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>Clashes Go on as Power Shifts Again in Tunis</td>
<td>David D. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In Peril: The Arab Status Quo</td>
<td>Anthony Shadid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cables from American Diplomats Portray US. Ambivalence on Tunisia</td>
<td>Scott Shane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANUARY 17, 2011</td>
<td>WSJ</td>
<td>Tunisia in tumult after leader flees</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Opposition will join Tunisian government</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Presidential Villas Become Target of Tunisian Anger</td>
<td>Margaret Coker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>In Tunisia, New Leaders Win Support of Military</td>
<td>David D. Kirkpatrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>France Acted Slowly on Tunisian Crisis, Wary of Interfering</td>
<td>Steven Erlanger</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All articles which were found to meet the following selection criteria were included in the final data, though pictures were removed because of their high
abundance and almost the absence of reference terms in the short written comments accompanying them:

- The selected article should deal with the issue of the Tunisian Revolution. Hence, the search process started by using “Tunisia” as a keyword and then only articles which tackle Tunisia’s uprising were selected.
- A specific date range which runs from January 12, 2011 to January 17, 2011 was set for the articles to be downloaded. The selection of this period is motivated by the fact that most of the U.S. newspapers happened to report the ongoing events in Tunisia roughly starting from the tenth. Additionally, the comparative aspect of this work required that the two examined periods should be of an equal time range, that is, three days before and after Ben Ali’s overthrow. As Such, a first set of articles running from 12th to 14th January, 2011 will be compared to a second collection of articles starting from January 15, 2011 to the 17th of the same month.

**Analytical Procedure**

Content analysis, a well-established methodology in the social sciences, is the basic analytical tool to be used in order to test the extent to which the argument advanced by this paper holds true. Content analysis is a technique which is used to quantify and analyse the presence, meanings, and relationships of certain words or concepts within texts. A text can be a book, an interview, a speech, a conversation, a newspaper article, or any form of communicative language (Busch et al., 2012).

As far as the present work is concerned, the analytical procedure initially involved conducting a content analysis on the collected data by manually sorting out and counting all instances of referring expressions employed to designate one referent, namely Ben Ali. Percentages were calculated and their results were represented in table format. Although manual content analysis proved to be time-consuming, it was not possible to take advantage of the instantaneous aspect of a rich variety of content analysis computer-assisted programs because of the nature of the identified features. Reference terms designating Ben Ali can be realized lexically and grammatically through a myriad of linguistic forms and cannot thus be made available to the content analysis software beforehand.
This quantitative analysis was, at a second stage, complemented by a qualitative approach to the data. Put differently, the frequency counts provided by the manual content analysis could only give insights into the salience of particular reference terms over other ones. Hence, a qualitative analysis was deemed indispensable to come up with more in-depth results. This second step of the analytical procedure chiefly consisted in generating interpretations from the recorded figures based on two major theoretical models reviewed in the literature overview. To explain further, terms which can be used both in address and reference such as T, FN, LN, and TLN are accounted for through recourse to the power versus solidarity framework while forms which more likely function as reference terms like “strongman” and “entrenched leader” are analyzed in terms of connotations.

Findings and Discussion

This section is devoted to reporting and comparing the results of the analysis conducted on 18 articles on the Tunisian Revolution published in *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times* from 12th to 17th January, 2011. The findings are grouped under three basic headings which reflect the major points discussed in the theoretical overview.

**The Wall Street Journal**

**Amount of coverage.** As far as *The Wall Street Journal* is concerned, the first remark relates to the very limited number of articles on the ongoing events in Tunisia issued during the three days preceding Ben Ali’s abdication (see table 1). Indeed, the conducted search resulted in only two articles appearing on 13th and 14th January, 2011 compared to six articles published during the same time range following this event, three of which appeared on the 15th, that is, in the wake of the expulsion of Ben Ali. No results were found on the 12th and the 16th. Therefore, these figures lay bare how the amount of attention and interest allocated to Tunisia’s uprising noticeably varied from the period during which Ben Ali was still in rule to the immediate aftermath of his overthrow. It follows that in terms of selectivity, the Tunisian Revolution was not a top priority issue for *The Wall Street Journal* till January 14, 2011 (see “Manipulation and Media Language”).
**Degree of formality.** A thoughtful look at the mosaic of reference terms variants depicted in table 2 provides a revealing insight into the varying levels of "power" and "solidarity" displayed by the reference terms used to designate Ben Ali. However, before launching on an exploration of the results, it can be noted from the outset that it was thought safer to exclude pronominal vocatives (he and him) from the analysis, seeing that there has been almost no mention of the classification they can have on the "power" and "solidarity" framework in the reviewed sociolinguistic literature on forms of address. As mentioned earlier, pronominal vocatives signaling relations of "power" and "solidarity" are typical of some European languages such as French (Tu versus Vous) while, in English, such relations are mainly realized through nominal vocatives such as "President Ben Ali".

Table 2

*Frequency of referring expressions designating Ben Ali in The Wall Street Journal*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Referring Expression</th>
<th>Instances</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>he</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>president</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ben Ali</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunisia Leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ben Ali</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He/him</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>president</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ben Ali²</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>strongman</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>autocratic leader</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Former president</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>former President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>leader</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sitting Arab leader</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

²In four of the instances the newspaper quotes other speakers/writers (50 people in Cairo, a US diplomat...)

---

**T A Y R Quarterly Journal**  
ISSN: 2382-2872  
Indexed in Scientific Indexing Services (SIS) and International Scientific Indexing (ISI)  
www.tayrweb.org/#/c34b
To start with, the referring expression which reigns supreme in terms of frequency of occurrence is “president” (32%) - not considering the pronoun option - as far as the first examined period is concerned (12th, 13th and 14th January, 2011) and “Mr. Ben Ali” (40%) for the period which runs from 15th to 17th January, 2011. By so doing, the newspaper signals a clear shift from referring to Ben Ali more frequently with a description of status and power through the use of the institutional title (T) to opting for a less formal and respectful designation of TLN (see “A Sociolinguistic Account of Address Forms”).

It is equally important to note that the institutional T option “president” was relegated to a third rank in terms of frequency percentage (10%) in the content-analyzed articles appearing in the immediate aftermath of Ben Ali’s abdication. Contrastingly, the TLN designation “Mr. Ben Ali” was found to rank the third (16%) in the data published prior to this event. Clearly, choices of reference terms seem to be aligned with the change of the power differential. The referent, after his ousting, is viewed by the newspaper as “Mr. X” more frequently than as his being the “President”, though at that critical period of power transition there was yet no news confirming his definitive stepping down of office. In a similar vein, the highly formal and respectful designation of institutional TFNLN “President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” dropped from ranking the fourth with 11% of frequency of occurrence in the first set of examined articles to sixth rank with only 3% in the compared data.

Another remark worth mentioning is that designating the referent by the LN option “Ben Ali” (8%) in the data issued after his overthrow represents a marked case. The markedness of this choice lies not only in its total absence in the first set of content-analyzed articles but also in the fact that it acts as a strong indication of

\[\text{entrenched leader} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]

\[\text{His Excellency President Ben Ali} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]

\[\text{long-time leader} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]

\[\text{President Ben Ali} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]

\[\text{the deposed President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]

\[\text{Zine el Abidine Ben Ali} \quad 1 \quad 1\%\]
solidarity rather than power and status, given that it is devoid of any mention of status “president” or even title “Mr.”. Although, as indicated by the tenth note, in four of the recorded instances of “Ben Ali” the newspaper quotes other speakers/writers, the mere presence of this least formal option in the articles invokes the newly emerging negative stance of the newspaper towards the referent. The absence of status is also signaled by the FNLN option “Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” which is used, though infrequently (1%), exclusively in the articles issued in the immediate aftermath of Ben Ali’s ouster.

Moreover, a noticeable naming practice appears in the second set of investigated print media texts. Although formal and prestigious reference options were still used to designate Ben Ali, some of these forms were preceded with the adjectives “former” and “deposed”. By opting for such designations as “former President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” (3%), “former president” (3%), and “the deposed President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” (1%), the newspaper stresses the idea that Ben Ali is no longer in power. This recognition can be taken as a tacit indication of a negative attitude towards the referent or at least a less supportive one. This may contrast with another recorded instance in which a highly positive description is added to the TLN option (“His Excellency President Ben Ali”). However, this designation cannot significantly invoke a positive stance because of its very low frequency of occurrence (1%) and the fact that it is simply a quotation from a statement issued by the Saudi Royal Court.

**Positive versus negative connotations.** As far as the other used designations are concerned, they are more likely to be employed in reference rather than address and they are thus analyzed through recourse to the concept of connotation (see “Evaluative Lexis and Connotation”). To start with, the reference term “Tunisia leader” (5%), which was sorted out from the articles published before Ben Ali fled the country, has positive overtones. In addition to the notions of charisma, wisdom, bravery, and heroism associated with the concept of leadership, the expression carries the connotation of patriotism which emanates from the combination of leader with Tunisia. In other words, Ben Ali is specifically identified by the newspaper as the
ruler of Tunisia and hence the one who has the upper hand on the ongoing situation. The same positive evaluation is characteristic of the use, in the second set of examined articles, of the two reference terms “leader” (3%) and “Arab leader” (1%) which almost share the same positive connotations attributed to the referring expression “Tunisia leader”.

With the exception of the two aforementioned reference terms, Ben Ali is found to be remarkably allocated negatively-loaded designations in the articles published in *The Wall Street Journal* immediately after his abdication. However, no trace of a similar negative representation was detected in the compared data. To explain further, the negative overtones emanating from the reference terms used to designate the referent can be grouped under two major categories. The first one has to do with the negative connotations of dictatorship and oppression associated with the use of “strongman” (4%), “autocratic leader” (3%), and “long-time leader” (1%) while the reference terms “entrenched leader” (1%) and “sitting Arab leader” (3%) create negative connotations of removal, dismissal, and rejection.

In a nutshell, there is a clear differential naming system which can be detected in the ways *The Wall Street Journal* referred to Ben Ali before and after his ousting, echoing a change of its attitude to this referent and, generally speaking, to the uprising unfolding in Tunisia. The next section explores whether a similar pattern will be characteristic of *The New York Times*’ account of the same event.

**The New York Times**

**Amount of coverage.** Similar to *The Wall Street Journal*, from a first glance at Table 1 in the methodology section, it can be noted that there are much fewer articles appearing prior to Ben Ali’s overthrow than after it in *The New York Times* (three versus seven articles). Till January 14, 2011, this newspaper does not seem to include Tunisia’s uprising among its top-selected reported events. Again, no results were found on the 12th.

**Degree of formality.** As table 3 reveals, in the first set of examined articles, the newspaper is found to refer to Ben Ali most frequently with the formal and deferential variant of institutional T “president” (16%) as well as the less formal and respectful designation of TLN “Mr. Ben Ali” (18%). In other words, there is an
alternation between emphasizing the status of the referent, hence increasing the social distance between him and the journalist who ultimately stands for the newspaper, and exhibiting a tendency towards informality and thus solidarity.

Table 3

Frequency of referring expressions designating Ben Ali in The New York Times

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Referring Expression</th>
<th>Before Ben Ali’s Ouster</th>
<th>Instances</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>he</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>president</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>authoritarian president</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>killer</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>leader</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. President</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States ally</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Referring Expression</th>
<th>After Ben Ali’s Ouster</th>
<th>Instances</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>president</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He/him</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>former president</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President Ben Ali</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4 All instances are quoted from other sources (Tunisian eye witness and former U.S. ambassador)
5 The designation was used by one of the Tunisian eye witnesses
6 The referring expression is quoted from the name of a Facebook group and is used ironically
7 Nine instances are quoted from other sources (Egyptian protesters, French officials, American diplomats...)

TAYR Quarterly Journal
ISSN: 2382-2872
Indexed in Scientific Indexing Services (SIS) and International Scientific Indexing (ISI)
www.tayrweb.org/#/cl4b
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arab leader</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab autocrat</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dictator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dictatorial leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fraud</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>longtime ally</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>one of the heaviest hands in the Arab world</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ousted President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>partner against terrorism</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In contrast, the data issued after Ben Ali’s abdication displays an exclusively marked high frequency of the TLN option “Mr. Ben Ali” (51%) compared to the much less frequent status description “president” (14%). Therefore, instead of an alternation between positive and negative evaluation, there is rather a strong confirmation of status denial, invoking the shaping of a more unfavorable stance.

Still, the first set of analyzed articles exhibits a tendency again to alternate between opting for the highly prestigious reference form of institutional TFNLN “President Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” (7%) and the least formal option used by the newspaper of LN “Ben Ali” (7%), though all instances of this latter negatively-loaded designation are attributed to other sources. As opposed to this equal distribution, the data published in the aftermath of Ben Ali’s ouster unveils a slight preference on the part of the newspaper for the status-denying option of LN (10%) over the formal and deferential reference variant of institutional TFNLN (6%) but without being fully committed to the designation of the referent as “Ben Ali”.  

Another point worth mentioning has to do with the more frequent use of the power-evocative variant of institutional TLN “President Ben Ali” in the first set of articles (11%), as opposed to the compared data (3%). Furthermore, similar to the naming practice detected in The Wall Street Journal, there is a conspicuous tendency tracked in the articles published after Ben Ali’s expulsion to precede some formal and

---

8 The reference term was used by some Egyptian protesters at the Tunisian Embassy
9 See note 4
10 See note 7
prestigious reference forms with the negatively-loaded adjectives “former” and “ousted”, as in “former president” (3%) and “ousted president Zine el Abidine Ben Ali” (1%). Even though an almost similar pattern can be noticed in the data issued prior to Ben Ali’s overthrow in that the highly formal and respectful designation “Mr. President” (2%) is used ironically, it is to be noted that the newspaper, once again, does not take full responsibility for this negative evaluation.11

**Positive versus negative connotations.** Shedding light on the concept of connotation as a mediator of evaluation, the rest of reference terms used in the first set of analyzed articles can be said to alternate between conveying positive and negative attitudes to the referent. On the one hand, the newspaper refers to Ben Ali with such designations as “authoritarian president” (2%) and “killer” (2%) which suggest the negative connotations of dictatorship and brutality respectively, though the latter description is quoted from another source. On the other hand, there is equally a choice of the favorable reference variants of “leader” (2%) and “United States ally” (2%), highlighting the positive attributes of heroism and bravery as far as the former alternative is concerned and those of cooperation, partnership, and mutual support for the latter. Such lexical choices serve to unveil the newspaper’s positive portrayal of the referent as being a ruler as well as a close friend.

In contrast, in the articles published in the immediate aftermath of the abdication, a slight favoring for variants encoding a kind of disapproval can be detected. Indeed, the referent is designated with five variants carrying highly negative connotations - “dictatorial leader” (1%), “Arab autocrat” (1%), “dictator” (1%), “one of the heaviest hands in the Arab world” (1%), and “fraud” (1%). The first four designations mediate the negative attributes of dictatorship and tyranny, thereby depicting the referent as one of the tyrants in the Arab world and implicitly legitimizing the protests against him. Ironically, this subtle legitimacy was accorded to the protests only after Ben Ali had fled the country. The last reference option foregrounds the unfavorable traits of dishonesty and immorality.

However, this does not deny that the newspaper referred to Ben Ali through the use of three favorable variants - “Arab leader” (2%), “partner against terrorism” (1%),

---

11See note 6
and “longtime ally” (1%) - encoding the positive attributes of charisma, wisdom, and bravery associated with the quality of leadership and those of shared interests, common good, and continued partnership and cooperation as far as the second and third reference options are concerned. By opting for such designations, the newspaper evokes the referent’s positive image of ruler and supporter.

Briefly, a careful exploration of the naming system adopted by *The New York Times* lays bare the disparity between opting for an alternation between positive and negative evaluation prior to Ben Ali’s overthrow and showing a firmer assertion of an unfavorable stance in the wake of this event.

**Discussion**

A look of reflection at the findings emerging from the analysis of patterns of news reporting of the Jasmine Revolution across *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times* reveals that the Obama administration’s “cautiously affirmative response” (Richard, 2011) to the unfolding uprising and its “wait and see” (Fillingham, 2012) approach to the Arab Spring at large are being tacitly replicated.

This politicized coverage manifests itself firstly in quantitative terms, given that the conducted search showed that the two newspapers issued fewer articles on the Tunisian Revolution before Ben Ali’s ousting than after it. Secondly, the tendency of *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times* for negative evaluation in designating Ben Ali has more prominence in the articles published after he had fled the country. Negative evaluation is realized through differential reference patterns, seeing that the two newspapers (with more salience in *The Wall Street Journal*) shifted from referring to Ben Ali through recourse to formal and deferential designations before January 14, 2011 to a naming pattern characterized by informality and a denial of status after this date. Thirdly, both newspapers opted for negatively-loaded reference terms to designate Ben Ali more frequently after his abdication than before it.

In stark contrast with these patterns of U.S. news reporting of Tunisia’s uprising, events in Libya and Egypt generated heavy news coverage (Ben Hassine, 2012). This disparity in U.S. media attention conspicuously persisted after the Revolution event for even when Tunisia receives media coverage, it is constantly in comparison with its neighbors. Generally speaking, “English-language media coverage of the Arab Spring ...
did neglect Tunisia in many ways, typically mentioning it as the spark, but rarely focusing on the small North African state itself.” (Leight, 2012). Contrastingly, Libya’s natural resources and Egypt’s strategic geographical location can be key factors accounting for the high level of U.S. news reporting of the unfolding events in both countries.

This lack of regular and comprehensive media coverage of Tunisia’s early protests in particular is not only typical of the American media but also of other major international news networks such as the BBC, France 24, and others which started to report the ongoing events in Tunisia on a regular basis only towards mid-January 2011 (Ben Hassine, 2012). This raises the issue as to how the unrest which reached its tipping point on January 14, 2011 gained huge attention and sympathy across different parts of the globe. Actually, through social media networks and blogs, Tunisians have bravely managed to keep the world abreast of their peaceful struggle for dignity, liberty, and democracy.

**Conclusion**

To conclude, the varying levels of “power” and “solidarity” and the different degrees of positive versus negative connotation displayed by the reference terms used to designate Ben Ali before and after his ouster in *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times* lay bare how the naming system is pragmatically-grounded. It is manipulated in accordance with the hidden attitudes of the two newspapers and thus the agendas of the existing power holders who dictate the rules of the game. To explain further, referential strategies opted for by the two newspapers are characterized by differential reference patterns which convey a more positive portrayal of Ben Ali prior to his overthrow, as opposed to the immediate aftermath. While positive representation manifests itself in the recourse to formal, prestigious, and positively-loaded referring expressions, negative portrayal has to do with the tendency for informality, denial of status, and the use of reference terms connoting negative attributes.

Indeed, results both in quantitative and qualitative terms unveil the biased and politicized nature of the U.S. print news media coverage of the "Jasmine Revolution". In view of this, Ben Ali’s expulsion and the subsequent changes in the political scene
and power differential in Tunisia were obviously projected through the language used by the *The Wall Street Journal* and *The New York Times*, signaling the shaping of emerging negative attitudes to Ben Ali and more support for the uprising. Ironically, though probably not accidentally, the same scenario is typical of the U.S. government’s stance on Ben Ali and the Revolution.

All in all, these findings serve as additional evidence on the argument implying that media discourse is constructed rather than natural and that media language is an exceptionally fertile area for manipulation in which ideologies can be subtly embedded. As such, it becomes increasingly doubtful that the mass media are capable of adopting a neutral stance on the reported events and stories, even when it comes to news media. Instead, they seem more likely to perpetuate their traditional role as the voice of the dominant bloc and the ruling class.

However, it is to be noted that asymmetry in referential practices is more prominent in *The Wall Street Journal* than it is in *The New York Times* and this testifies to the potential variations which can be tracked in U.S. print newspapers’ account of the Tunisian Revolution. Therefore, more larger-scale research is inevitably needed for a more exhaustive account of the U.S. media coverage of Tunisia’s uprising, yielding results which can lend themselves to generalizations.

**References**


Identification of Japanese Religious Immigration In Contemporary Canadian Minorities’Literature

By Sawssen Ahmadi

Abstract:

Canada is recognized by its multiculturalist policies which increase the number of immigrants who flee from the harsh conditions of their home countries. Among the great waves of immigrants to Canadian territories emerge diverse artists. The common feature, that unites these artists, is their classification as minorities since they do not belong to the Canadian majority. In fact, this dichotomy of majority versus minority is omnipresent in every single field and all over the world specially in the “multicultural” Canada. This is made clear in Asian Canadian literature and more specifically in women’s writers literary works. These women are Japanese Canadian writers. The fact of being of mixed origins fuels their artistic writing skills to uncover the hidden troubles they are facing as members of minority groups. The major problem of these minorities might be their identity and how to identify it in a multicultural world.

This paper sheds the light on two Japanese Canadian female writers and their way of representing their religious difference in order to emphasize their ethnic identity and to criticize their situation as a minority. The focus will be on Joy Kogawa’s Obasan (1981) and Hiromi Goto’s Chorus of Mushrooms (1994) and their feminist methodologies of satirizing globalization and multiculturalism as two processes manipulating these minorities’ identities including even their religious
identity which is normally an untouched part. To achieve such a goal, the feminist approach would be very pertinent to analyze relevantly both novels’ plots.

**Keywords:** Religious identity, religious dislocation, religious minority, hybridized religious background.

**Introduction:**

As a matter of fact, there are not many critics studying Joy Kogawa and Hiromi Goto’s works because they are two contemporary writers belonging to a Japanese minority in Canada. However, the ones that are interested in such a kind of trans-ethnic literature produced by these double origin writers concentrate, generally, on themes like: cultural identity, ethnicity, racism and migration. There are, for example, some critics who focus on the theme of “silence”, and explain it the following way, "silence in the writing of Asian-American women writers should not be considered negatively [...] there is a racial and cultural arrogance inherent in evaluating Asian-American silence" (Young 395).

Other reviewers agree on the fact saying that “the characters are mostly fictional or composite; if modelled after actual people, their identities are scrambled. But the historical materials used are all too real” (Mulhern 172). Actually, there are scholars who justify their study of these women as “marginalized women writers who write about communities with ‘wounded histories’ or histories that have been lost, silenced, contaminated, or exterminated” (Zamora 309). Other scholars’ investigations, to this kind of trans-ethnic literature produced by minorities like Kogawa and Goto, lead them to coin the term ‘autoethnography’:

Since the late 1990s, the study of Asian Canadian literature has evolved into a dynamic area of research that not only identifies and explicates texts, but also examines how they intervene in the cultural politics of race in Canada. [...] the term ‘autoethnography’ has been used by scholars to describe the work of authors who portray their own cultures through
autobiographical practices. Like anthropology, autoethnography is engaged in the description of different cultures even as both are self-reflexively critical in regards to the assumptions behind cross-cultural representation.

For many Asian Canadian writers, autoethnography has been an empowering mode through which to bring previously marginalized cultures into visibility [...] to reinforce the otherness of minority cultures by rendering them consumable by mainstream readers. (Lee 319)

As it is stated in this quote, Asian Canadian literature is not an old literature to be well known and criticized thoroughly, this is why one can not find many critics discussing *Obasan* and *Chorus of Mushrooms*, and in order to be read Kogawa and Goto have to come up with provocative themes.

Readers used to read about the issue of cultural identity and its representation in minorities’ literature. Then, the task of reading about religious identity, particularly, in postmodern literature would be such an innovative matter. In fact, Kogawa and Goto as two Canadian women writers with a Japanese origin offer their readers the opportunity to discover themes like religious identity, religious discrimination, generational-religious gap, religious dislocation and hybridized religious background.

As two feminist writers, they draw a literary bridge between their religious identity and their real identity as a minority in Northern American lands since “the aim of a feminist criticism as of any revolutionary criticism should be to subvert the dominant discourses, not to make compromises with them” (Ruthven 6). The two women are not merely telling their experience as a minority but they are criticizing, ironically, both their group's loss of identities and the majority's politics and purposes to control them. In that context, both women teach people a lesson about migration and its impacts on migrants. They show us as readers that immigrants’ views to their dream lands like Canada, are just illusionary attitudes because we:
Often err in our perceptual judgments concerning how things are [...]
we are subject to occasional illusions and hallucinations.
And not everything in the world manifests its true nature to casual perception for things are sometimes different from the way they perceptually appear to be. (Hacker 1)

Generally speaking, people think that their migration to Canada will offer them better life conditions and these writers awake these dreamers in reminding them of the illusionary nature of their dreams built upon trivial material objectives, regardless of the danger threatening their rights as humans and citizens. The first part of this paper is devoted to the representation of the Japanese religious system in the two novels, but it is not a matter of comparing the two works as long as both novels unite to stress out the confronted issues by these migrants. While the second part will be dedicated to point out the influence of globalization and multiculturalism on religious migration and in all the cases, these minorities are the victims.

I – Japanese Religious Representation in the Canadian Literature:

Obasanis a narrative work written by the Canadian novelist, Joy Kogawa, who is of a Japanese descent. It is a literary work that tells the endurance of Japanese people in Canadian “concentration camps” during the World War II (Kogawa 41). The whole plot of the novel is built upon the female protagonist's sad memories of her family members and how they were scattered after the tragic war, “we're trapped, Obasan and I, by our memories of the dead – all our dead – those who refuse to bury themselves” (Kogawa 30). What makes this novel special is the fact that it is written by a woman writer, its major characters are female ones and the first person narrator is also a woman. The heroine is called Naomi Nakane who expresses her astonishment about the characters of her two aunts. The first one, ObasanAya, an...
emblem of silent ambiguous woman. The second is called Aunt Emily, who is an epitome of active militant woman, “How different my two aunts are, one lives in sound, the other in stone. Obasan’s language remains deeply under-ground but Aunt Emily, BA, MA, is a word warrior” (39). On the one hand, they have different characters. On the other hand, they share common points like the fact of being Canadian women with a Japanese descent and their struggle to find their real identities as minorities.

As a woman writer belonging to a minor group, Joy Kogawa transcends the normal treatment of the theme of identity and its representation. In other words, writers like her would talk about the theme of cultural identity to identify themselves. However, Kogawa opens to her readers another gate of artistic creativity. She refers to religion to identify their situation in Canada. In Obasan, the characters do their best to find their real identities as a ‘yellow’ race living in Canadian territories and yearning to obtain Canadian citizenship, “Whenever the words ‘Japanese race’ appeared, Aunt Emily had crossed them out and written ‘Canadian citizen’ […], ‘What this country did to us, it did to itself,’ she said” (40). These are the words of Aunt Emily and how she considers herself as well as her family as Canadians. Being considered as Canadian citizen is very crucial for the characters’ survival as human beings. To achieve such a goal, they have to be like the majority, in other words, they have to assimilate. The act of assimilation or acculturation contains their culture, language, behavior, food, traditions and to adopt blindly the majority’s modes of life. As an artist, Joy Kogawa shows in her novel that assimilation can attack even religion.

Generally speaking, religion is a system of beliefs of supreme importance in one’s life which means that even the attempt to change a person’s religion would be considered abnormal. Then, Japan as an Asian country is very known with its religious diversity. The most common religious tribes and beliefs, there, are mainly the Shinto and Buddhism12. The question that could be raised here is: what is the religious belief of Japanese people who migrate to live elsewhere, as it is the case of

12 Dictionnaire de la Sagesse Orientale: “Buddhism in Japan: Buddhism in Korea was introduced to Japan in 522 […], eventually was recognized by the emperor Yomei in 585. It was under the reign of Prince Shotoku (593-621) that Buddhism became the official religion of Japan.” (this is my translation to the original quotewichis in French language): « Le bouddhisme au Japon: Le bouddhisme en provenance de Corée fut introduit au Japon en 522 […], mais finit par être reconnue par l’empereur Yomei en 585. C’est sous le règne du prince Shotoku (593-621) que le bouddhisme devint religion officielle du Japon» (75 - 76).
those in North America. A possible answer could be reaped from the ways they use to express themselves as it is the case of Joy Kogawa in *Obasan*. She exposes thanks to this novel the religious beliefs of her female characters. For example, Naomi Nakane who is the first person narrator and the protagonist, does not follow any religion. She is a faithless young woman. She does not mention during the whole novel her affiliation to any religious tribe, but she keeps telling what are the religious affiliations of her family. It is worth noting that there are three different generations in *Obasan*, and Naomi explains that, “My mother’s a Nisei [...] , my grandparents, born in Japan, were Issei, or first generation, while the children of the Nisei were called Sansei, or third generation” (Kogawa 8-9). Thus, Naomi who is classified as a “Sansei” or third Japanese generation in Canada, has no single relation with any religion. While her grandparents or the “Issei” are Buddhists and the following quote reveals that, “the man who is going to take Grandma’s body up the mountain is called Mr. Draper [...] Grandpa Nakane is Bud-dhist. It was Grandpa Nakane’s wish that Grandma Nakane’s body be sent for cremation and her bones and ashes returned to him” (Kogawa 153). Through this quote, Naomi declares the name of the man who was assigned to take her grandmother’s corpse to the mountain for cremation since the dead old woman and the grandfather are still Buddhists. Afterwards, Naomi talks about the other members of her family and what kind of religion they follow, “Obasan tells us that [...] , she and Uncle are Christians, like Mother and Father” (153). Consequently, there are Christians among them. Thereafter, she depicts them practicing this religion as if it were their religion and not westerners’ religion:

Sensei says loudly, “Let us pray” [...]And everyone repeats in a mixture of Japanese and English [...] “I believe in one God, the Father Almighty, Maker of heaven and earth - miyuru mono to miezaru mono no tsukurinushishinzu.” [...]Father, Obasan, and Uncle are kneeling but the others stand, their hands formed into cups in which Sensei places the paper bread. One by one the hands rise to the mouths, taking first the wafers, then the wine from the silver chalice, tiny as an egg cup.”Drink this in remembrance that Christ’s blood was shed for thee and be thankful”. (Kogawa 209-211)
The above stated quote reports the instructions of the Japanese priest “Sensei” to Naomi’s family members and his guidance during their performance of the rituals of Christianity. The humorous point is their mixture of English and Japanese languages during their prayers. This indicates that either they are unable to use pure English since it is not their mother tongue, or they do not want to neglect totally their real origin as Japanese, so they include Japanese phrases sometimes. In both cases, they reveal that they are living within an inner exile as a minority.

Besides, Naomi uses the word “exile” so many times to emphasize the fact of their inner conflict between Japanese identity and Canadian one. Their perplexed practice of Christianity entails their inner confusion concerning what to follow and what to abandon. This is exactly what was depicted by Naomi as, “our exile from our place of exile” (Kogawa 236). Not only that but in another occasion Naomi proclaims her attitude towards Christianity, “All of Christians is like this. A mixture of white lights and colored twinkling lights in the dark” (86). This sentence connotes a powerful metaphor in which, she perceives Christmas as a mixture of white lights and colored lights in the dark, in referring implicitly to white people with “white lights” while the colored ones to people of color, whom situation is dark and darkened by whites. Consequently, there are three different categories of Japanese living in Canadian lands. The first category includes the first generation or the “Issei” who preserve their religion as Buddhists. The second category contains the second generation or what’s called the “Nisei” who affiliate to Christianity. The last category comprises the third generation who are indifferent and neutral with no single religious belief.

It may be true that Joy Kogawa was the first Japanese Canadian writer who deals with the theme of religion as a way to identify themselves as minorities, but she was not the only one since Hiromi Goto emerges as a writing brain drain treating the same topic. Indeed, Goto is another woman writer whose destiny drives her to be an ambassador for Japanese identity in North America. Thanks to *Chorus of Mushrooms*, Goto has won “the Commonwealth writers Prize for Best First Book in the Caribbean and Canada Region” (Goto 1). It is a narrative marked by the female dominance and
its diverse provocative themes like; sexuality between whites and people of color, racism, majority versus minority, hybridized language and generation gap. In this novel, Goto exposes three different female characters belonging to the same family that are namely Naoe, Keiko and Murasaki. Such a literary work has two main features characterizing it. The first is that it has two distinct narrative voices. The second is that one of the two narrators has two names. The plot of the novel is built upon the stories and the Japanese tales that the grandmother used to tell to her granddaughter Murasaki. Thus, the narrative voice is divided between the grandma or “Obachan” Naoe and Murasaki. Actually, Naoe calls her granddaughter with a Japanese name, Murasaki, while her parents call her with a western name, Muriel. The status of holding a Japanese name and another Canadian one highlights the hyphenated identity of this girl, who is torn between the first preservative Japanese generation and the second assimilationist one.

Naoe, a narrative voice in parallel with Murasaki, is an old woman faithful to her real origin. She understands English language but she speaks only Japanese. Moreover, she eats Asian food and is usually criticizing the behavior of her daughter, Keiko. In addition, she challenges Keiko’s choice of calling her daughter Muriel as a Canadian name, she rather calls her Murasaki, “I may be an old fool, but […] My granddaughter, your daughter, Keiko. You taught her no words so she cannot speak, she calls me Obachan and smiles […] Muriel does not suit her, Keiko. I call her Murasaki" (Goto 15). These are the words of a mother blaming her daughter for not teaching her granddaughter their original culture and declaring the suitability of the name Murasaki as a Japanese name. The generation gap here appears to emphasize the difference and the distance between the three generations in their manner of dealing with and representing their identities as a minority in a host country like Canada. As a matter of fact, Goto as a writer treats this identity quest from a religious angle.

It is logical that a Japanese Canadian writer like Hiromi Goto would write about Japanese’s experience in Canada. She observed that scrutinizing the religious belief of her female characters could be very pertinent to clarify their real identities through three Japanese successive generations living in Canada. Obachan Naoe, for
instance, does not state her religious belief explicitly. She expresses in different situations her hatred to and her dissatisfaction with Christianity and the following quote is an evidence:

Listen, Murasaki, listen. Do you wonder why the wind hovels like a stricken woman? Do you wonder why the rain sometimes tastes like blood. Che! The Greeks. Forget the Greeks! And don’t quote Bible verses to me, Child. There were stories long before Eve tasted fruit fit for women. (Goto 18)

This is how Naoe addressed Murasaki during her act of telling her untold stories. Such tales are of a tremendous importance since they guarantee the continuity of the Japanese anecdotes and traces as a minority. Added to that, her words denote an implicit religious message. She ordered Murasaki, “don’t quote Bible verses to me, child” (18). As if she wants to say that verses from the Bible would not convince her, or are not persuasive arguments according to her. Later on, Naoe tells Murasaki about her brother Shige and his wife Fumiko, who have got old and childless. They find themselves praying to God to bestow them with a child. She says that they, “visited temples and climbed steep stairs to pray at the shrines [...] But to no avail. The gods didn’t hear you, or perhaps they had other matters” (Goto 70). The sarcastic tone of Naoe is very evident in these phrases. Instead of saying the God with a capital “G”, she utters “gods” with a non capitalized “g”. Undoubtedly, she is not a Christian woman since, in Christianity, people believe in only one God. Consequently, Naoe’s talk about several “gods” could be a proof that she is still faithful to one of the Japanese religious sects since they worship diverse gods. Therefore, the grandmother Naoe believes in a Japanese religion that she has not mentioned plainly. This is concerning the religious identity of the first Japanese generation in Canada, so how about the second as well as the third ones?

Keiko, who is Naoe’s daughter and Murasaki’s mother, is an assimilationist Japanese woman and this is made clear even in her daughter’s choice of Canadian name, Muriel. Unquestionably, she would imitate westerners even in
their religious systems. In the following quote, Muriel speaks about the church that her mother visits:

When Pastor Lysol was appointed to Mom’s church, he brought with him a whole new agenda […] “If during the past week, you have felt the hand of God touch your lives, please share with us, your family in Christ […] Oh Lord, hear the words of Thine weak children! […]”

For-forgive the weakness of women. So little they have changed since the fall of Eve into earthly Sin. We can only turn to Thine eternal love and beg for forgiveness […] We beg of you. In Jesus’ name. A–men. (Goto 101)

Muriel reports the prayers of the newly appointed priest in her Mom’s church. The fact of being up-to-date with the nomination of ‘Pastor Lysol’ demonstrates that Keiko pursues Christian religion very well and goes frequently to this church. Moreover, she is witnessed praising Muriel’s boyfriend as a Christian ‘white’ man and the next conversation with her daughter confirms that fact:

“What happened to Hank ?”[…]Mom said […] “Oh Muriel! He was such a nice boy too, even though his family goes to the church of Christ. What happened ?”[…]

“Mom, he wanted to have Oriental sex with me.”

“Oh, well, the Bible says we should wait, ummmmm[…]”.(Goto 124)

After reading the above-mentioned dialogue, one can notice the paradoxical character of Keiko. She goes to the church like any normal Christian, and despite that she elucidates her disfavor to “the church of Christ.” It could be true that as a Japanese Canadian, she follows some Christian rituals and neglects other ones. In that case, it is possible to talk about hybridized religious background and hyphenated religious identity for the second generation of Japanese people in Canada.

Muriel or Murasaki, this third generation girl, seems to be confused about her choices of language, food, clothing and even religion within an unbalanced family.
Contrary to her grandmother who maintains her Japanese unstated religion and her half-Christian mother, Muriel appears to hold a neutral relation with religion. The upcoming quote uncovers Muriel’s religious perception, “There were words in excessiveness when we sat in church […] That god was not a bellower, but light as motes of dust. That there wasn’t a definitive god but god-spirits living in everything I saw around me […] The gods would never linger in pews stinking with selfish guilt” Goto 99). Starting from what is professed, she goes to the church like her mother but she is not Christian, because in Christianity there is only one God with a capital “G”. Furthermore, she speaks about ‘god-spirits’ and ‘god’ with a noncapitalized “g”. She compares God to “motes of dust”, which is a sign of disrespect of God and religion. As a narrative voice in the novel, she counts how in school days her teachers used to teach them about divine justice:

*When I was little, so very little, my Mom made me go to Sunday school where I learned, “Red and Yellow, Black and White They are precious in His sight Jesus loves the little children of the world!”

“Everybody is the same,” the teacher said, “Jesus doesn’t see any difference at all. He loves you all the same.” I thought that Jesus must be pretty blind if he thought everybody was the same. Because they weren’t. They weren’t at all […]. At Christmas time, there was always brown paper bag for each child […] And a Jap orange.

“We thank you Lord, for this wonderful Jap orange” (Goto 58-9)*

This long quote summarizes the issue of racism and the badtreatment of people according to their skin colors, “red”, “yellow”, “black” and “white”. It carries Muriel’s ironic message addressing the racist people in mocking her teacher’s claims. She asserts that Jesus must be blind to view them “the same”. She exposes her harsh criticism to Christianity and her disbelief in Jesus who “doesn’t see any difference at all”. Thus, Muriel is unlike her mother and grandmother, she does not believe in any
II – The Influence of Globalization on Religious Migration:

As representatives of Japanese identity in North America, Kogawa and Goto select the religious topic to be one of the thematic pillars in Obasan and Chorus of Mushrooms. One can notice the religious division within the same family in both novels. This religious disagreement is the result of the generation gap to end up with a religious gap. The instability of the religious background of these Japanese figures enhances the fact of their religious dislocation there. In both works, the female characters blame the white majority for discriminating them and for their attempts to assimilate them. However, those who adhere to Christianity, were not forced by white Canadians to affiliate to Christianity. Actually, their religious matters can not be visible to the majority whether they assimilate or not. Subsequently, if this Japanese minority chooses Christianity willingly, then their pretensions of being victims of assimilation must be put under investigation.

According to the previously stated analysis, Kogawa and Goto, that are minorities belonging to religious minorities in Canadian territories, succeed to dismantle the religious truth of their minor group. This can be a gesture of feminism and a new ‘weapon’ to fight and to challenge both their minor group as well as the major group. Through their female characters, they articulate the religious instability of their Japanese group, but also the defeat of the white majority and their endeavors to control them. The practice and choice of religion is beyond the reach of the political power which can neither determine nor monitor the religious faiths of these minorities. Therefore, there is at least one way for minorities allowing them to act freely without any fear of being discriminated which is religion and all this happens due to globalization. As an invisible minority, Kogawa and Goto were able to deal with the silent issues in their lives thanks to globalization which changed the whole world, and most importantly it develops the rights of marginalized people and their opportunities to express themselves freely. This is what encourages women like Goto and Kogawa to hold the roles of modern, creative, innovative and transgressive religious system. This is how Hiromi Goto introduces the religious gap inside this dislocated Japanese family.
writers doing their best to convey their voices and to identify the Japanese identity in Canadian lands. This is the positive side of globalization, would there be a dark side?

It is agreed that globalization endows writers like Goto and Kogawa with so many rights to excel in their literary writings. However, globalization has its drawbacks on these people and this is made clear by the female characters in the novels. In Obasan and Chorus of Mushrooms as well, one can witness that the first generation preserve their religious beliefs as Japanese, while the second generation are assimilationists or half-Christians and the third are neutral faithless characters. The religious variance between the same family members illustrates their inner confusion as persons and identities. Here comes the interference of globalization which gives these minorities the freedom of religious choice, so that they find themselves unable to decide. This is what creates their internal instability. It might be true that if they were obliged to adhere to Christianity, things would appear to them much clearer. Not only the phenomenon of globalization which complicates the situation of these victimized minorities, but also, multiculturalism plays an important role in causing their internal tragic turmoil.

It is known that, “since the 1990s, the Canadian multicultural discourse has increasingly focused on the concept of citizenship, which may in turn have meant insisting on the notion unity, at the expense of that of diversity” (Cressman 13). This means that the primary and the ultimate goal of the multicultural policy is to guarantee the unity of the country and not the diversity and this threatens the minorities’ original cultures and identities once they are obliged to unify and to forget about “diversity”. In order to understand the multicultural policy in just few words, it is very useful to quote this analysis:

Over the years, the Canadian government has made multiculturalism the keystone of its political and economic identity. The official discourse emphasizes this element at the international level. At the national level, diversity management is more nuanced: the country works primarily on the unity of the
heterogeneous components of society to preserve Canada's interests in an international context of concern. (Azzimani 55)\textsuperscript{13}

Subsequently, the multicultural system seeks the profit of the majority regardless of what can happen to the minority that leaves its home country for its miserable conditions. Such minorities find themselves in sarcastic situations within their dream land, Canada, where the central focus is on the political and economic identity of the country and not the identity of the minorities. Then, whether these minorities are allowed to preserve their original culture or obliged to assimilate and to forget their origins, it is undeniably a hard responsibility. This is why some scholars, who are studying the Canadian multicultural system, agree on that judgment:

Multiculturalism was accused of marginalizing immigrants by constantly referring them to their culture of "origin". This is, for example, the opinion of the famous writer Neil Bissoondath (1995), himself a former migrant: he denounces a policy which, he says, interferes in private life and uses public funds to preserve uses that he considers "private." (Bertheleu 22)\textsuperscript{14}

This is Hélène Bertheleu's viewpoint coined with the opinion of the experienced migrant writer, Neil Bissoondath who denounces multiculturalism in
\textsuperscript{13}This quote is originally written in French (and the provided English translation is mine). The original quotesays, «Au fur et à mesure des années, le gouvernement canadien a fait du multiculturalisme la clé de voûte de son identité politico-économique. Le discours officiel insiste sur cet élément au niveau international. Au plan national en revanche, la gestion de la diversité est plus nuancée: le pays travaille surtout sur l'unité des composantes hétérogènes de la société pour préserver les intérêts du Canada dans un contexte international considéré comme préoccupant ».

\textsuperscript{14}This quote is also written originally in French (the above given translation is mine). The original quoteis, “Le multiculturalisme était accusé de marginaliser les immigrés en les renvoyant sans cesse à leur culture d' ’origine’. C'est par exemple ce que pense le célèbre écrivain Neil Bissoondath (1995), lui-même ancien migrant: il dénonce une politique qui, dit-il, s'immisce dans la vie privée et utilise des fonds publics pour préserver des usages qu'il juge 'privés'. "
accusing it of marginalizing immigrants and controlling them indirectly in interfering in their private lives. At that level, one can relate the multiculturalist policy to the phenomenon of globalization since both complete one another to serve the majority’s goals at the expense of the minorities (or intruders).

Undoubtedly, that “under the rubric of globalization, we need to explore the tensions between sameness and difference, between centripetal and centrifugal tendencies, and between consensus and fragmentation” (Coupland 5). These minorities seem to be lost between these concepts; “sameness”, “difference”, “centripetal”, “centrifugal”. All these terms turn around the circle of the dichotomies; the ‘center’ versus the ‘margin’, and the ‘us’ versus ‘them’. In other words, globalization helps the majority to reach the peak and advance very well, but it is like a monster for the minorities that are unable to decide whether to ‘imitate’ the majority or to preserve their uniqueness as representatives of foreign ethnicities. This phenomenon is simply a kind of transformation that “implies a more radical change, whereby flows modify the character of the whole global systems in which they function. Boundaries and units are themselves refashioned, as well as things flowing across and between them” (Coupland 7). Such radical changes touch even human beings internal stability, their freedom of making choices and more dangerously affect their identities. This is what Goto and Kogawa tried to convey to their readers. They wanted to show through their characters’ religious loss the extreme danger facing these minorities in a globalized world.

Conclusion :

This paper shows the feminist identification of Japanese religious immigration in Canadian minorities’ novels. The two Japanese Canadian women writers, Joy Kogawa and Hiromi Goto provide a representation of the religious issue in their narratives Obasan and Chorus of Mushrooms. Thanks to their female characters and their feminist techniques, they reveal to their readers that being a religious minority could affect easily one’s identity, its construction and representation as well. In that sense emerges the concept of religious dislocation in diasporic literature. In fact,
globalization as well as the multiculturalist policy influence these religious minorities, so that they find themselves facing hybridized religious backgrounds. Ironically, the same family members have to confront not only generation gap as dislocated people, but also challenging a very disturbing religious gap causing them an internal turmoil and affecting badly their psychologies and lives.

References:
Lee, Christopher. Rev. “Asian Canadian Writing Beyond Autoethnography” by Eleanor Ty,


Plongeron, Bernard. «Avant-propos.» Histoire du Christianisme (des origines à nos jours):


Ditransitive voice in medical and sociological academic articles

By Sabiha Choura

Abstract

The active/passive voice distinction has been extensively studied in the literature. Previous research on voice includes Alley (1996), Rogers (2014), Humphrey and Holmes (2009) and Schultz (2013). The latter focus mainly on outlining the functions of each voice, but they do not consider analyzing the active/passive voice in a genre specific corpus nor do they study the variation in its distribution according to verb complementation types. This motivates the present research being mainly interested in describing the active/passive voice in relation to ditransitive complementation on the one hand and in exploring how these distributions are influenced by the specificities of the Research Article Genre, the Scientific Register and Medical and Sociological Disciplines on the other hand. The present research attempts to explore how the distribution of active and passive ditransitives is determined by the generic features of the corpus under study.

To achieve this objective, a corpus of sociological and medical research articles is collected. This corpus is analyzed via the UAM CorpusTool allowing the generation of quantitative data which is tested by using Yule’s coefficient. These quantitative results are then analyzed qualitatively. The present paper has shown that passive ditransitives outnumber active ones, which is attributed to the importance of the former in achieving conciseness and downplaying writers’ visibility. The distribution of the active/passive voice of ditransitives is also shaped by disciplinary norms as passive ditransitives are more frequent in Medical Science than in Sociology, a
discrepancy which is traced back to the unpredictability of the sociological context and the multitude of participants, findings and interpretations in Sociology.

**Keywords:** ditransitive complementation/ active and passive voice/ Medical Science/ Sociology/ disciplinary norms/generic features

1. **Introduction**

Research on verb complementation in this paper is justified by its importance in building the structure of any clause (Sinclair, 1990, p. 137). In fact, a clause is composed of a subject and a verb which can be followed by one or two complements (Downing & Locke, 2006, p. 34). The choice of this linguistic feature is also motivated by its being a potential source of making errors by novice researchers (Granger & Paquot, 2009). As Granger and Paquot (2009, p. 208) claim, “novice writers draw more extensively on high-frequency verbs and employ a more restricted number of lexico-grammatical patterns when compared to professional academic writers.” Hence emerges the crucial role of verb complementation in allowing researchers to voice their presence and to acclaim their contribution in their corresponding cultures. In the context of the present research, both medical and sociological writers have to acclaim their findings in accordance with the specificities of the genre, register and the disciplines to which they belong through the choice of the appropriate verb complementation categories. The latter include intransitive complementation, monotransitive complementation, ditransitive complementation, complex-transitive complementation and intensive complementation.

The present research paper will be limited to the analysis of ditransitive complementation which refers to verbs which are complemented by two obligatory constituents. In this context, Mukherjee (2005, p.80) defines a ditransitive verb as “a trivalent verb that requires a subject, a direct object and an indirect object for a complete syntactic complementation.” Thus, ditransitive verbs fit the SVOO pattern. While the first object called the indirect object is usually animate, the second one known as the direct object is usually inanimate (Quirk & Greenbaum, 2003, p. 353).

Studying only ditransitive complementation is justified by the fact that previous research concerning the analysis of ditransitive complementation in the Research Article Genre is lacking (Mukherjee, 2005). This genre is considered as the
most common genre for the production and proliferation of knowledge (Livnat, 2012) as it allows writers to claim new discoveries while making them accepted by the corresponding community (Hyland, 1998). It is characterized by particular norms reflecting the beliefs of the corresponding research community (Hyland, 2004) and writers’ lexico-grammatical choices.

As Thompson (2004, p. 43) puts it, lexico-grammatical choices are determined by genre which “deploys the resources of a register (or more than one register) in particular patterns to achieve certain communicative goals.” In other words, within this culture, i.e. the Research Article Genre, writers draw upon a particular register repertoire, i.e. the Scientific Register. The latter is characterized by precision, clarity, conciseness, explanation and forthrightness (Alley 1996; Lindsay, 2011; Rabinowitz & Vogel, 2009). Within this genre and register, the lexico-grammatical choices are also influenced by the specificities of the disciplines academic writers operate in. In the present context, two disciplines which are the Medical Discipline pertaining to the hard domain of knowledge and Sociology belonging to the soft domain are selected.

Obviously, the Research Article Genre, the Scientific Register, the Medical Discipline and the Sociological Discipline have specific norms and rhetorical characteristics (Hyland, 1998), which determine writers’ lexico-grammatical choices. For instance, the Scientific Register is characterized by the more frequent presence of the active voice than the passive one (Alley, 1996; Rogers, 2014). The choice of the active/passive voice is investigated in this research in order to find out whether this distinction holds or not for ditransitive complementation. Ditransitive voice is analyzed from a systemic functional perspective based on the textual metafunction.

This metafunction is concerned with how interactants – readers and writers – in a particular situation process the information contextualized in a text. This metafunction “provides resources for creating ideational and interpersonal meaning as a flow of information in the unfolding of text” (Matthiessen, 2004, p. 635). In other words, the textual metafunction is concerned with how the message is organized in a way that reflects how speakers or writers construe the world and how they manage their interpersonal relations with others.
Textually, there are two levels at which the message can be organized: the clause unit and the information unit (Halliday, 1994, p.308). While the clause unit textually consists of two parts: theme versus rheme, the information unit is made up of two units which are Given and New. These two “configurations of structural functions” “together constitute the internal resources for structuring the clause as a message – for giving it a particular status in relation to the surrounding discourse” (Halliday, 1994, p.308). Concerning the clause level, the theme is the element which the writer or the speaker locates at the beginning of the clause whereas the rheme is the element following the theme. The theme rheme structure of the clause is explained in Table 1.

### Table 1. The theme rheme structure of the clause (Adapted from Halliday and Matthiessen, 2004, p. 90)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Rheme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The duke</td>
<td>has given my aunt that teapot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My aunt</td>
<td>has been given that teapot by the duke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That teapot</td>
<td>the duke has given to my aunt</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding the information unit, it consists of the New – that is, the unpredictable – and the Given – that is, the known and the predictable. In Halliday’s words (1998, p. 203), “The ‘Given’ is what is being presented in the discourse as recoverable, to be taken as read; while the ‘New’ is what is being foregrounded for attention.”

The interplay between information structure and thematic structure gives writers the opportunity to create various rhetorical effects in the Research Article Genre, the Scientific Register, the Medical Discipline and the Sociological Discipline. Studying the choices of active and passive ditransitives may thus guide novice researchers in conforming to the norms of their cultures while achieving their objectives.

### 2. Methods

To explore the distribution of active and passive ditransitives in the Research Article Genre, a corpus of 165 medical articles and 78 sociological ones is collected. To this corpus, both quantitative and qualitative methods of analysis have been applied.

#### 2.1. Quantitative analysis

According to King, Keohane and Verba (1994, p. 3), “[q]uantitative research uses numbers and statistical methods. It tends to be based on numerical
measurements of specific aspects of phenomena; it abstracts from particular instances to seek general description or to test causal hypotheses.” In other words, quantitative analyses include the measurement of the frequencies of the variables under investigation which are in the present research active ditransitives and passive ditransitives.

The quantitative analysis is carried out in this research via a computer program called the UAM CorpusTool. This software allows the generation of frequencies about the variables under investigation.

2.1.1. UAM CorpusTool

Seeing the size of this corpus, the UAM CorpusTool, software for text annotation, is used first to annotate ditransitives and second to classify them into the active and passive voice. The annotation of these features is carried out through the following layer:

Figure 2. Active/passive ditransitive layer

To conduct a cross-analysis of ditransitive voice according to disciplines, another layer labeled discipline is created. This layer, as can be seen in Figure 2, allows the researcher to account for the frequencies of ditransitive voice in each sub-corpus.
These two layers are useful to find about the frequency of occurrence of the active and the passive voice in the corpus as a whole and to explore how this distribution is affected by the generic features of the Research Article Genre and the Scientific Register. They also allow the analysis of ditransitive voice in the medical and sociological articles in order to uncover how choices in each sub-corpus are influenced by disciplinary norms.

2.1.2. Yule’s coefficient

This statistical test is used to check whether there is a correlation between variables. According to Triki and Sellami-Baklouti (2002, p. 65), it allows researchers to answer the following question: “if an individual has property A, does this mean that it is probable that it also has property B?” It is counted by applying the following formula:

\[ Q = \frac{(A-B)}{(A+B)} \]

The values of A and B are calculated “by multiplying the four observed values 2 by 2 ‘in a cross’”. The value of the obtained coefficient ranges from -1 to +1. If this value is outside the [-0.30, +0.30] interval, the correlation is confirmed (Triki & Sellami-Baklouti, 2002, p. 65)

In the present research, Yule’s coefficient is useful in finding out whether the active/passive voice of ditransitives is correlated with the two disciplines under study.

These quantitative results are, then, analyzed qualitatively, as will be explained in the following section.

2.2. Qualitative analysis

According to Denzin and Lincoln (1994, p. 2), “[q]ualitative research is multmethod in focus, involving an interpretive, naturalistic approach to its subject matter.” That is, “qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them.” As such, qualitative analysis is useful in the present research for the interpretation of the frequency of occurrence of the variables which are active
and passive ditransitives. It is also beneficial in accounting for the distribution of these variables in each sub-corpus.

3. **Results and Discussion**

The distribution of the active/passive voice is first analyzed in the corpus as a whole in order to find out how the choices of these linguistic features are determined by the characteristics of the Research Article Genre and the Scientific Register. Second, it is studied in each sub-corpus in order to uncover which voice is more frequent in each discipline and to provide an account of how disciplinary norms determine their distribution.

3.1. **Distribution of active and passive ditransitives in the corpus as a whole**

This subsection deals with the distribution of ditransitive active verbs and ditransitive passive verbs in the Research Article Genre and the Scientific Register. These distributions\(^\text{15}\) are displayed in Table 2.

**Table 2. Distribution of active and passive ditransitives in the corpus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Corpus</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Active voice</td>
<td>1574</td>
<td>39.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive voice</td>
<td>2425</td>
<td>60.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3999</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The statistical findings in Table 2. show that passive ditransitives (60.64%) are more frequent than active ones (39.35%). To explain this difference, the functions of passive ditransitives will be first analyzed through the following examples:

- **M 1918.** The increases *have been ascribed* to the emergence of a hypervirulent *C. difficile strain, known variously as North American Pulsed Field type*
1 (NAP1), restriction-endonuclease analysis (REA) type BI, or polymerase-chain-reaction ribotype 027 (referred to collectively as the NAP1/BI/027 strain).

- **S 1864.** Having children, caring for an ill family member, and working 25 or more hours per week are associated with taking longer leaves for women.

These two examples M 1918 and S 1864 are effective clauses in which the verbal group is in the passive voice. Through this voice transformation, participants can have different textual positions. Indeed, in example M 1918, the Attributor is removed from its position as unmarked theme which becomes occupied by the Carrier. In example S 1864, the Assigner is deleted to leave its place to the identified as the unmarked theme. Although the passive voice and its active counterpart have the same propositional meaning, they are construed differently.

By selecting the passive voice in these examples, writers give prominence to the Carrier instead of the Attributor/Assigner. In such a way, the omission of the Attributor/Assigner allows writers to present this information as a general truth validated in the literature. Obviously, one of the functions of the passive voice in the Scientific Register is to generalize a particular piece of information.

Another function of passive ditransitives is illustrated through the following examples:

- **M 1039.** The patients were told that they could start doing light jobs 3 to 4 days after the procedure.

- **S 2626.** Our confidence in the reliability of the measure is also strengthened because respondents were asked to report sex composition categorically rather than as an exact percentage.

In these receptive clauses M 1039 and S 2626, the Sayer is removed; instead, the receivers occupy the position of the unmarked theme. Omitting the Sayer from the unmarked theme position can be explained by two reasons. The first one is that writers attempt to shed light on the receivers of the message as they are participants involved in the research rather than on the researchers. Indeed, by shifting readers’ attention to the participants, writers aim at focusing on the procedures adopted during the experiment.
Thus, the passive voice emerges as a device for emphasis, and therefore as a tool allowing writers to act upon readers through shaping their perception of the message. The second reason is that readers can infer that the sayers of the message are the researchers. Therefore, passivization enables writers to delete the Sayer when it can be recuperated from the context through inferences. Accordingly, it can be considered as a good cohesive device enabling writers to avoid repetition while at the same time keeping cohesion in the text.

In addition to creating cohesion, passive ditransitives can reflect writers’ perception of the situation, as is shown in the following sentence:

- **M 817** In one unpublished study, the increase in mortality was attributed by the sponsor to a baseline imbalance in risk created by randomisation, or an unusually low rate of mortality in the placebo arm of these trials.

Like the carrier in examples M 1039 and S 2626, the one in example M 817 occupies the place of the unmarked theme. Through changing the place of the participants, writers foreground the carrier – i.e., an important finding. However, example M 817 is different from examples M 1039 and S 2626 in that, in the former case, the Attributor is not omitted, but it is moved to a later position in the sentence. Reintroducing the Attributor in the sentence presents this piece of information as New. Therefore, specifying the Attributor creates precision in the writing as writers do not want readers to understand this piece of information as one of their interpretations. By holding another person responsible for the claim, writers highlight that it is not an established piece of truth in the literature, thus showing a hidden opposed voice to it.

Just as passive ditransitives in academic writing can reflect writers’ stance, they can also uncover their protective tone, as can be seen in the following sentences:

- **S 830** they are denied equal respect and feel reluctant to participate in the wider society's civic and political life ([Benhabib, 2002] and [Castles, 2005]).
- **M 1441** whether restrictive use of antibiotics in these five tertiary-care settings was associated with a change in frequency of deaths or nursing expenses.

Both examples are receptive clauses. In example S 830, the receivers of the message take the theme position because the action of denial is rather negative as it
deprives the receivers from their rights in society, thereby resulting in inequality. This reflects the writers’ attempts to hide the Sayer since revealing his/her identity will cause him/her to be seen in negative lights. Thus, one of the functions of the passive voice in academic writing is to avoid assigning negative qualities, messages and actions to the Sayer.

Similarly, in example M 1441, omitting the Assigner and presenting the identified as the unmarked theme in the clause show how writers aim to defocus the agency of the Assigner as researchers do not manage to confirm or reject the association between the identified and the identifier. In this way, the passive voice is an effective tool to hide the failure of the researchers in studying this particular connection. Accordingly, in both examples, the passive voice serves as a protective measure through which writers try to manipulate the negative connotation which may be associated with the Sayer.

Another function played by the passivization of ditransitives can be seen in the following example:

- **S 1887** Witnesses with a feminist viewpoint emphasized the importance of women being protected from firings and the idea that the opportunity of men’s help at home may lead toward women’s advancement in the labor force.

Example S 1887 is a receptive clause realized by a passive verbal group. Passivization can be explained by the fact that the Actors can be either authorities or company owners. In other words, authorities can make laws promoting women’s employment or company owners should design internal regulations in the company in order to defend women’s rights. Therefore, selecting the passive voice can be explained by the indefinite reference to the Actor.

Passivization of ditransitives can also have another meaning, as is clear in the following sentence:

- **S 2471** Several explanations have been offered for the different effects of sexual orientation on earnings for men and women.

Sentence S 2471 is another example of a receptive clause. Indeed, the Actor is not mentioned; instead, the message takes the unmarked theme position because readers cannot trace back the message to a particular Actor. This reflects writers’
attempt to highlight the general stream of thought before specifying the details. Thus, striking a balance between the general and the specific renders scientific writing precise.

The last function of passive ditransitives can be seen in the following example:

- **M 938** In Denmark, proton pump inhibitors are not prescribed routinely for patients receiving aspirin but mainly for patients with a clear therapeutic indication, such as peptic ulcer disease.

In this receptive clause, readers can identify the Actor from context. Omitting the Actor is a way to reduce the number of participants involved in this event from three participants to only two. Thus, passivization serves as a tool for achieving conciseness. As Laadhar (2013, p. 90) confirms, passivization results in “[condensing] the personal styles of the writers”

The following table summarizes the functions of passive ditransitives in the academic research articles under study.

**Table 3. Functions of the passive ditransitives in the Corpus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functions of passive ditransitives</th>
<th>1- Generalizing a particular piece of information.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2- Foregrounding particular participants over others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3- Shaping readers’ perception of the message.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4- Serving as a good cohesive device enabling writers to avoid repetition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5- Reflecting writers’ stance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6- Being a protective measure to manipulate the negative connotation which may be associated with the Sayer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7- Indefinitely referring to the Actor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8- Striking a balance between the general and the specific to render scientific writing precise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9- Conferring conciseness to the writing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As for active ditransitives, they represent 39.41%. The following example illustrates these verbs.
• **M 303** Our finding that women with hormone associated venous thromboembolism have a lower risk of recurrence than do women with venous thromboembolism that occurs in the absence of any antecedent risks may reassure clinicians and patients of a good prognosis after hormone associated disease, assuming discontinuation of hormonal therapy.

This sentence M 303 is an operative clause. The cause – being one of the findings in the research – is the unmarked theme in this example. The active voice allows the writers to describe the effect of one finding on a particular subpopulation. If the writers used the passive voice, the readers would not be able to identify which particular finding has this particular result. Specifying the particular research finding enables writers to be more direct and explicit.

In addition to conveying explicitness and directness to the writing, active ditransitives have another function which is illustrated by the following sentence:

• **M 2487** Once-daily oral treatment with teriflunomide provided sustained benefits for patients with relapsing multiple sclerosis during the 108-week study period.

In this operative clause M 2487, the unmarked theme specifies a particular type of treatment. Through the active ditransitive verb, the writers describe the benefits this treatment has for the Beneficiary. Therefore, the active voice renders the writing more precise.

Not only do active ditransitives render the writing more precise, but they also result in objectivity, as can be seen in the following example:

• **S 734.** Turks constitute one of the most devalued immigrant groups in Flanders and many Flemings associate them with lower socio-economic status, criminality and a disrespect for gender equality (Snauwaert, 2002).

Through the active ditransitive in the operative clause S 734, the writers highlight the agency of the Assigner. Indeed, they want to hold a particular group – i.e., many Flemings – responsible for the action of assigning a negative value to another group. By unveiling the identity of the Assigner, they attempt to achieve objectivity.
Through using the active voice, writers can also achieve clarity, as is evidenced by the following example:

- **S 34** Learning a foreign language can provide an individual with greater insight into other cultural groups and expand their world view.

In this example S 34, the writers opt for an operative clause where learning a foreign language serves as the unmarked theme. By means of the active voice, therefore, the writers remove ambiguity. If to provide was in the passive voice, the readers would not be able to recuperate the unmarked theme, thus resulting in ambiguity. Considering that the sentence is long and that the readers cannot guess the Inducer in the passive voice, the active voice enables the writers to achieve clarity.

Just as the active voice can result in clarity, it also has another function which is illustrated by the following sentence:

- **S 796** Studying the wishes and fears expressed by adolescents gives us knowledge of the nature and level of their emotional adjustment (Pintner & Brunschwig, 1937).

Sentence S 796 is an operative clause; by selecting the active voice, the writers try to foreground the relation between the researchers’ actions and the readers’ responsiveness to the message. In other words, they aim at creating a personal tone by emphasizing the benefit of the action – i.e., studying the wishes and fears expressed by adolescents – to the researchers – i.e., Pintner & Brunschwig – and other scholars within the same culture. This reveals how writers motivate other researchers to read about this particular topic and to familiarize them with the research context.

Another function of active ditransitives is creating dynamism in scientific writing, as is shown in the following example:

- **S 545 & S 546** The immigrant group indeed attached a higher value to interdependence than the native Dutch group did.

By opting for two successive operative clauses, in this example, the writers try to make the writing vivid. The two active ditransitives, in these clauses, stand for the actions of a particular group, which confers motion and liveliness to the writing.
Therefore, one of the functions of the active voice in scientific writing is creating dynamism.

Table 4. summarizes the functions of active ditransitive verbs in the academic research articles under study.

**Table 4. Functions of active ditransitives in the Corpus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Function</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-</td>
<td>More direct and more explicit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-</td>
<td>More precise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-</td>
<td>Objective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-</td>
<td>Clear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-</td>
<td>Familiar and motivating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-</td>
<td>Dynamic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Alley (2013, p. 106), “the key to choosing between an active and passive verb is to ask which form is more natural. Most often, an active verb is more natural.” The findings of the present study are not consistent with the claim of Alley (2013) who analyzes the different types of verb complementation. Limiting the focus to ditransitives per se, the present research has shown that passive ditransitives are more frequent than active ones. This discrepancy may be explained by the length of ditransitive structures, reflecting writers’ preferences for a concise over a precise and clear writing on the one hand, and the various functions of passive ditransitives in this genre and register on the other hand.

Obviously, the analysis has shown that academic writers choose passive ditransitives over active ones. The analysis of these selections is conducted in both disciplines in order to see whether they are also determined by disciplinary variation.

**3.2. Distribution of active and passive ditransitives per discipline**

This subsection focuses on the distribution of active and passive ditransitives across Medical Science and Sociology, as is displayed in Table 5.

**Table 5. Distribution of active and passive ditransitives in Medical Science and Sociology**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Function</th>
<th>Medical Science</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As Table 5 indicates, active and passive ditransitives are not equally distributed. This variation can be better visualized through the following figures:

![Pie Chart 1](image1)

**Figure 3. Distribution of ditransitive voice in the two sub-corpora**

As can be seen in Figure 3 and Table 5, active ditransitives in Medical Science are nearly half of those in Sociology. On the contrary, passive ditransitive verbs in Medical Science exceed those in Sociology. In order to confirm the correlation between voice and discipline, Yule’s coefficient is counted as follows:

\[ Q = \frac{(A-B)}{(A+B)} \]

\[ A = 1290*1134 = 1462860; \quad B = 440*1135 = 499400 \]

\[ Q = \frac{(1462860-499400)}{(1462860+499400)} = 0.49 \]

The computed coefficient is outside the rejection interval (-0.30 and +0.30). Therefore, the distribution of ditransitive voice is correlated with discipline. In order to account for the differences in the distribution of the active and passive voice of ditransitive verbs according to discipline, the following examples are analyzed.
• **S 803.** In this way, social contexts provide important feedback to adolescents about whether a possible self is positively or negatively valued and can shift the perceived likelihood that an expected or feared possible self is likely.

• **S 804.** Thus, acculturation experience could give them new issues that they could consider to build their own future wishes and fears.

• **M 1409.** In China, babies are given the hepatitis B vaccine at birth.

Examples S 803 and S 804 are operative clauses taken from sociological articles. The selection of the active voice can be explained by the fact that readers cannot guess the original unmarked theme after a passive transformation. Therefore, the active voice serves as a useful tool allowing researchers to go beyond the unpredictability of context. As for example M 1409, it is a receptive clause extracted from Medical Science; although the Actor is removed, readers can guess his/her identity from their background knowledge. Taking into account that sociological phenomena are affected by a multitude of factors, attributing a process to the corresponding Initiator in Sociology is a difficult task for the readers.

The difference in the distribution of the active and the passive voice can also be explained by the following set of sentences:

• **M 2247.** The susceptibility to candida in patients with APECED is attributed to autoantibodies to interleukin-17 and interleukin-22, since type 17 helper T cells (Th17) are crucial for mucosal antifungal immunity.

• **M 1206.** For example, TNF-alpha inhibitors act as a regulator against pentosidine formation, oxidative DNA damage, and lipid peroxidation and is associated with a decrease in serum levels of oxidative stress markers, and also anti-CCP antibody levels in RA patients [23,24].

• **S1865.** whereas not surprisingly, union membership has also been linked to increased leave taking (Sandberg, 1999).

• **S 2307.** This is a striking result given previous research that has linked a preference for rock, in general, and heavy metal, in particular, to school failure and school dropout among American and Swedish youth (Arnett 1991b; Roe 1992).

• **S 1474.** Although scholars have conceptually linked power and control to DVAW, few studies have actually tested this linkage cross-culturally.
While examples M 2247, M 1206 and S1865 are receptive clauses, examples S 2307 and S 1474 are operative clauses. Using the passive voice in Medical Science (M 2247 & M 1206) is a way for the writers to display their findings. In doing so, they can present their results as generalizations in their field of expertise. Unlike medical writers, sociological ones resort to the active rather than the passive voice when providing their findings (S 2307 & S 1474). Even when they opt for the passive voice in order to present the latest findings in this area of research, they include in parenthetical forms the authority issuing these claims (S1865). Therefore, sociologists cannot draw conclusions with higher certitude as much as medical writers do. The difference in reporting the findings of the research can be attributed to the nature of each discipline. Indeed, sociological findings are characterized by relativism as they may not be applicable in all places and times and to all participants; various interpretations can be drawn depending on the context in which sociological research has taken place. Accordingly, the relativism and the multitude of findings and interpretations in this research area urge writers to choose the active voice in order to make each authority responsible for his/ her results and interpretations. Obviously, sociologists have a stronger presence than medical writers. This claim is supported by Hood (2011, p. 115) who maintains that humanities are associated with visibility, unlike natural sciences characterized by invisibility.

Another reason accounting for the variation in the distribution of the active and passive voice of ditransitives can be shown in the following set of examples:

- **S 2625** The NSCW asked respondents, “Do you feel in any way discriminated against on your job because you are a man/woman?”
- **S 843** Security threat was assessed with: “PCIs/NJIs/UOs pose a threat to the security of the State of Israel,”
- **S 956** “I tell everything to the people who are close to me”
- **S 1956** To test the hypothesis that labor market conditions defined by city, education and sex explain differences in marriage by education, we compare Equation 2 to Equation 3:
- **S 50** Three managers in the company under study distributed the questionnaire to the Non-international employees within the company.
• **M 1038** They were recommended to wear lumbar braces for a period of 6 to 8 weeks after the intervention.

• **M 2365** The manufacturer of the ITD, Advanced Circulatory Systems, supplied devices to the study network at a reduced price for the trial and provided nonbinding advice to the investigators about the design of the study before it was implemented.

• **M 95** Physicians gave the participants a list of food products that are commonly consumed in the Netherlands, together with their sodium content, at the time of inclusion.

• **M 856.** Women who gave birth to a stillborn baby at or after 28 completed weeks of gestation in the Auckland region between July 2006 and June 2009 were invited to participate in the study.

In the examples taken from Sociology, different agents can occupy the unmarked theme position. These agents can be researchers (S 1956), social agents helping researchers (S 50), participants taking part in the research (S 956), particular organizations promoting research (S 2625) and interactants in society (S 843). Therefore, various agents are involved in sociological research. On the contrary, in Medical Science, a more limited number of agents are involved. These agents can be researchers (M 1038 and M 95), participants in the research (M 856), and subsidiary agents helping researchers in conducting a particular piece of research (M 2365). This accounts for the more frequent use of the active voice in Sociology than in Medical Science; whereas sociologists, when describing their methodology, need to identify which particular agents are conducting the described action, medical ones have more freedom to remove the agent since a limited number is involved, thus enabling readers to predict the doer of the action.

All in all, passive ditransitives are more frequent than active ones in both disciplines. These findings partially support the results of Laadhar\(^\text{16}\) (2013) who claims that passive verbs (56 %) are more frequent than the active ones (44%) in Medical Science. This can be attributed to the detachment and predictability of the medical context. The discrepancy between the active and the passive voice is even

\(^{16}\) Laadhar (2013) investigated the voice of all the types of verb complementation.
greater in the present medical corpus, thus lending further support to the claim that a condensed packaging of information is preferred when it comes to ditransitive complementation. However, unlike the present research showing that passive and active ditransitives in the present sociological corpus nearly have the same frequency of occurrence as they represent 50.10% and 49.89% respectively, Laadhar (2013) finds out that passive verbs (34%) nearly represent half of active verbs (66%) in Pragmatics, a discipline belonging, like Sociology, to the soft domain of knowledge. The more frequent use of the active voice in Pragmatics and Sociology in comparison with Medical Science can be attributed to the lower degree of certitude, relativism and the unpredictability of context in the former disciplines. Nevertheless, the discrepancy in the distribution of the active/passive voice can be explained by the length of ditransitive structures.

3.3. Conclusion

This paper has investigated whether the generic features of the Research Article and the specificities of each discipline influence ditransitive voice. The analysis has shown that passive ditransitives are more frequent than active ones. This is accounted for by the conciseness resulting from passivization and the various functions the passive voice has in downplaying writers’ visibility. Across disciplines, the analysis has revealed that active ditransitives in Medical Science are nearly half of those in Sociology. This is accounted for by the unpredictability of the sociological context and the multitude of participants, findings and interpretations in Sociology. Although the study of ditransitive voice shift can guide novice researchers in operating within their cultures, a more comprehensive analysis of the active/passive voice of the different types of complementation in this context could be more insightful.

References


doi:10.2200/S00128ED1V01Y200809ENG009.


Laadhar, A. (2013). The use of the passive voice in scientific discourse: medical and pragmatics research articles as a case study (Unpublished Master thesis). Faculty of Arts and Humanities of Sfax, Sfax.


Modality as a convincing Strategy for Political Power Abuse: Tony Blair’s speech on the Iraqi crisis as a case study

Abstract:

Language and politics are deeply related to each other. This relation is originally attributed to the importance of speech in politics as a way to manipulate the public. The issue of power and power abuse is a serious problem of political domination happening in modern democratic republics (Van Dijk, 2008, p. 2). This paper examines the manipulative strategies of the British Prime Minister Tony Blair (1997-2007) in his speech delivered on 18 March 2003 in front of the British Parliament about the British military action against Iraq. This analysis is grounded in Halliday (2004), Van Dijk (2006), Palmer (1986) and Chilton (2004). Epistemic Modality’s ultimate objective is to unveil the manipulative strategies of Blair to add weight to his integrity in the eyes of the public opinion as well as Parliament. His ultimate objective is to get the green light to wage a war on Iraq.

1. Background to the Study

Political Discourse Analysis aims at unveiling the struggle of politicians for power through language. This sheds light on the role of discourse as a form of action (Atkinson & Heritage 1984; Boden & Zimmennan 1991; van Dijk 1985). In this context, this paper examines the role of language in the realization of political ends. More precisely, this paper studies Tony Blair’s speech in front of the British Parliament in order to gain support to wage a war on Iraq in 2003. Actually, this corpus is chosen because it has a great historical and rhetorical importance. “Tony Blair, with this and other discourses, manipulated both MPs and British public opinion so as to be able to legitimate the British participation in the war in Iraq” (van
Moreover, this corpus stresses the relationship between political discourse and ideology. “Language and politics are social stances; the one, a medium used by society for the purposes of communication and cohabitation, the other, loosely, the ideas and activities used for gaining and exercising power in society.” (Adetunji, 2006, p. 177).

2. Literature Review

The discourse of politicians has been a major concern of Critical Discourse Analysts (Chilton, 1997, 2004; Van Dijk, 2005, 2006; Fairclough, 1989, 1997, 2003) to the point of laying the foundations for a specific discipline defined as Political Discourse Analysis (Chilton, 2004). The focus in such studies has been the manipulation of language as a means of power praxis and control of the masses. Politicians are often called upon to act on their audience by legitimizing certain states of affairs or policies or mystifying other states of affairs and policies (Chilton, 2004, p. 4). Following the footsteps of Orwell, it is quite interesting to analyze political discourse as the defense of the indefensible (Orwell, 1981). This makes politicians do their best to ensure well worded discourse. In fact, they always try to legitimize their actions through their speeches. Often, political discourse is meant to legitimize political action and to influence public opinion even if this action is difficult to defend.

2.1. Chilton’s approach to Political Discourse Analysis

Chilton sees that a human being is a political animal by nature since he has been endowed with “the power of speech” (Chilton, 2004, p. 7). Concurring with this, language is indispensable in the world of politics. In this section, an attempt will be made to deal with political discourse as a “must for anyone interested in the way language is used in the world of politics” (Chilton, 2004: preface). Moreover, language is very important for political life (Chilton, 2004, p. 15). In his approach, Chilton distinguishes between two levels in politics: the macro-level and the micro-level. Within the micro-level, “there are conflicts of interest, struggles for dominance and efforts at co-operation between genders, and between social groups of various kinds” (Chilton, 2004, p. 5). Also, Chilton sees that within the micro-level of politics, people use a variety of techniques such as persuasion, rational argument, irrational
strategies, threats, entreaties, manipulation...in order to achieve their objectives (Jones et al, 1994, p. 5 cited in Chilton, 2004, p. 5).

Focus is laid in this paper mainly on the macro-level of politics as it is deeply related to the objectives of political discourse analysis. As Chilton argues, within the macro-level “there are the political institutions of the state, which in one of the views of politics alluded to above serve to resolve conflicts of interests, and which in the other view serve to assert the power of a dominant individual (a tyrant) or group” (Chilton, 2004, p. 5). It is then clear that the macro level of politics deals with the various strategies used by power holders so as to maintain their power and domination.

Equally, the macro level institutions are types of discourse with specific characteristics - for example, parliamentary debates, and broadcast interviews. And constitutions and laws are also discourse – written discourse, or text, of a highly specific type. (Chilton, 2004, p. 6)

So, the macro level of politics deals with the different dimensions of power that political discourse holds. Newmeyer (1986) argues that the importance of language study comes from the fact that there are different fields which study language such as social science, natural science, human science, etc. Also, Newmeyer adds that each field has its own understanding of language corresponding to its focus and its main interests (Newmeyer, J, 1986, p. 6).

Chilton and Schäffner (1997) maintain that language is fundamental when doing politics. They define politics “as a struggle for power, between those who seek to assert and maintain their power and those who seek to resist it” (Chilton and Schäffner 2002, p. 5). As such, political discourse analysis unveils the controversial aims of politicians which are meant to be hidden through the different manipulative strategies.

2.2. Systemic Functional Approach to modality

Modality as a linguistic device encompasses a variety of forms, including (but not limited to)
modal auxiliaries, modal verbs, modal adverbs, and modal adjectives. Halliday looks at language through the functions it serves. His approach considers the distinction between three functional components of language which are ideational, interpersonal and textual (Halliday, 1978, p. 112-113). The interpersonal function, in which modality operates, concerns the intervention of speakers and hearers in speech (Halliday, 1976). Halliday (2004) makes the distinction between two major types of modality. These types are as follows:

(1) **Modalization** (indicative type): there are two types in modalization:
- Probability (may be)
- Usuality (sometimes)

(2) **Modulation** (imperative type): there are two types in modulation:
- Obligation (is wanted to)
- Inclination: (wants to)

(Halliday, 2004, p. 618)

According to Halliday (2004), modality is defined as follows:

Modality refers to the area of meaning that lies between yes and no- the intermediate ground between positive and negative polarity. What this implies more specifically will depend on the underlying speech function of the clause. (1) If the clause is an ‘information’ clause (a proposition, congruently realized as indicative), this means either (i) ‘either yes or no’, that is, ‘may be’; or ‘both yes and no’, that is, ‘sometimes’; in other words, some degree of probability.

(Halliday, 2004, p. 618)

Halliday (2004, p. 618) gives an example of each of the four types of modality indicated below:

**Probability:**

*Example:* There can’t be many candlestick-makers left.

**Usuality:**

*Example:* It will change right there in front of your eyes.
**Obligation:**

*Example:* The roads should pay for themselves, like the railways.

**Inclination:**

*Example:* Voters will not pay taxes any more.

(Halliday, 2004, p. 618)

Epistemic modality operates within the first type of modalization which is ‘Probability’. “In philosophical semantics, probability is referred to as ‘epistemic’ modality” (Halliday, 2004, p. 618). Epistemic modality is defined by Halliday as external to the content, being a part of the attitude taken by the speaker (Halliday, 1970, p. 379). Modality has to do with the speaker’s cognitive dimension; ‘the essence of "modality" consists of the relativization of the validity of sentence meanings to a set of possible worlds’ (Keifer 1994, p. 2515). From a speaker's point of view, modality is ‘the speaker’s cognitive, emotive, or volitive attitude toward a state of affairs’ (Keifer, 1994, p. 2516).

So, epistemic modality is the judgment of the addresser within a proposition. It holds the speaker's loyalty as well as his voice in his discourse. Within this context, “The term ‘modality’ is a cover term for a range of semantic notions such as ability, possibility, hypotheticality, obligation and imperative meaning” (Depraetere & Reed, 2006, p. 269). That is, modality within a proposition allows the speaker to present it as certain, possible or probable according to his interests (Van Dijk, 2008). That is, modality is essential in the management of knowledge in public discourse. As such, epistemic modality is a sort of intervention of the speaker in a proposition.

Halliday (2004, p. 622) provides a sophisticated list of Modal Operates. This list is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Pol.</th>
<th>Transf.</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Orientation</th>
<th>Modal item</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>probability</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>implicit</td>
<td>Subj ective Must</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Object ive Certainly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Subje     Will</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**T A Y R  Q u a r t e r l y  J o u r n a l**

**ISSN:** 2382-2872

Indexed in Scientific Indexing Services (SIS) and International Scientific Indexing (ISI)

www.tayrweb.org/#!/cl4b
<p>| | | | | | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: List of Modal Operates

In the table above, Halliday (2004) gives some aspects of epistemic modality. These aspects are mainly polarity (positive/negative), transference (transferred/not transferred), and certainty (certain/not certain).
transferred), degree of probability (low/median/high), orientation of probability (explicit/implicit), and whether this type of probability is objective or subjective. Also, Halliday (2004) provides, in this table, some modal items which express epistemic modality. These items such as ‘needn’t, possibly...n’t, etc are not frequently used.

Halliday (2004) deals with some tools of epistemic modality. For example, modal auxiliaries can be used to signify two different things: Consider ‘You must be very careful’ and ‘You must be very careless’; whereas the first statement means ‘you are requested to ...’ or ‘it is obvious that you are...’ only the latter interpretation is meaningful for the second. Because of this duality, ambiguities occur and it is interesting to see how such ambiguities are resolved (Halliday, 1976, p. 200-201). So, modality in a sentence is an active involvement of the speaker to influence the addressee. It is a strategy to mystify the ideological purposes of the addressee. Modality in the Hallidayan sense is often associated with the speaker’s intervention in his/her speech. In university counseling discussions, it has been remarked that counselors were using both ‘high’ modality indicating that they are certain about what they said and ‘low’ or ‘weak’ modalities for uncertainty (Halliday, 1985, p. 75). So, the degree of certitude of the speaker depends on modality in his discourse.

The study of epistemic modality in Tony Blair’s speeches about war in Iraq is useful to investigate the degree of presence and intervention of the speaker in the corpus under study.

2.3 Fairclough’s approach to CDA

Fairclough’s approach concerning ‘Critical Language Study’ includes different fields such as sociolinguistics, pragmatics, cognitive psychology, etc. Fairclough (1989, 1992, 1995) At this point, it is valuable to introduce CDA as a field deeply related to ideology. The present article tries to investigate the power dimension that language holds. One of the crucial tasks of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is to account for the relationships between discourse and social power. Fairclough (1989) argues that a deep language analysis contributes to understandings about power relations in language study. According to Fairclough (1992, p.28), discourse is more than just language use, whether speech or writing, seen as a type of social
practice. Thus, “a political speech is often used to try to convince, and even to try to persuade, an audience that there is often propaganda involved as well” (Kristenson, 2004, p. 4). Consequently, politicians use language to make other people believe them. In fact, political discourse plays the role of political action rather than mere statements. It is “a language of action, an argumentation for social action based on the appeal to social values” (Lemke, 1995, p. 14)

Fairclough insists on the social dimension in discourse analysis: “Textual analysis is a valuable supplement to social research, not a replacement for other forms of social research and analysis” (Fairclough, 2003, p. 16). Actually, discourse analysis has concentrated on the process of theory formation and the interdisciplinary nature of its research since its beginning (Fairclough and Wodak, 1997; Van Dijk, 1997, Wodak, 2001).

Fairclough (1989) argues that Critical Discourse Analysis unveils the different power relations and ideologies in discourse. He maintains that a close analysis of language contributes to understanding power relations and ideology in discourse. An interesting feature of Fairclough’s (1989) book, Language and Power, is its focus on describing a method for analyzing discourse. This method consists of three major steps in text analysis, namely description, interpretation and explanation.

Faircough identifies the first step in text analysis as “the stage which is concerned with formal properties of the text” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 26). So, description of language is essential in discourse analysis. This stage is different from the other stages indicated by Fairclough in analyzing discourse. In the case of text description, it is misleading to describe a text according to its formal features in terms of a descriptive framework (Fairclough, 1989, p. 26). “The object of description, the text, is often seen as unproblematically given. But this is misleading, as spoken discourse shows particularly well: one has to produce a ‘text’ by transcribing speech” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 26). In this sense, text description can have a great effect on the results obtained from discourse analysis.
The second step in text analysis concerns mainly interpretation of the text under study. “Interpretation is concerned with the relationship between text and interaction - with seeing the text as the product of a process of production, and as a resource in the process of interpretation” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 26).

The third step in text analysis deals with the explanation of it. “It is concerned with the relationship between interaction and social context-with the social determination of the processes of production and interpretation, and their social effects” (Fairclough, 1989, p. 26). This step determines the social dimension in the text. It clarifies the different social aims of discourse analysis. The explanation of a given text unveils the aims of the addressee behind the production of his discourse. It gives an idea about power relations within the text.

To conclude, the three steps identified by Fairclough (1989) explain the way the text has to be analyzed in order to unveil the power dimension held by language. In other words, Fairclough puts the stress in his approach on the indispensable steps which have to be followed so as to study the manipulation of language in political discourse.

2.4 Palmer’s approach to CDA

Palmer (1986) makes a distinction between epistemic and evidential modality. He claims that these two systems are the two main types of Propositional Modality. With epistemic modality, the speaker expresses his judgment about the factual statement of the proposition, whereas with evidential modality, the speaker indicates the evidence he has for its factual status (Palmer, 1986, p. 8). Fowler et al (1979) maintain that modality reflects for them power differentials between participants in communication. Concurring with this, the modal aspect within a proposition translates the power dimension in it.

Kress and Hodge (1972, p. 122-128) claim that modality is understood in a more limited sense of duality of certainty (epistemic modality) or power (deontic modality). That is, epistemic modality is inserted by the speaker to hide uncertainty.
and lack of knowledge. Thus, modalization or epistemic modality is a mystifying strategy by the speaker to veil his ignorance or lack of information.

Events and knowledge may be presented as modalized in several ways–for instance as certain (necessary), probable or possible – depending again on the interests of the authors. If climate change is described as certain, then policies to stop it may become unavoidable, but not when it is presented as a remote possibility or as uncertain. Knowledge grading is therefore an essential strategy in the management of knowledge in public discourse, (government and media reports, etc.) (Facchinetti et al, 2003). So, epistemic modality allows the speaker to intervene in the propositions he says.

The subject of evidentiality has been dealt with by Brinton and Brinton (2010). In their book, *The Linguistic structure of Modern English*, they claim that modal meaning refers to matters of possibility and necessity. According to Brinton and Brinton (2010), modality can be analyzed through two major meanings:

- [+Epistemic]: epistemic meaning which is a matter of belief (inference, deduction), such as potentiality, possibility, probability, prediction, or certainty; or
- [+Deontic]: deontic meaning is a matter of action, such as permission, duty, responsibility, obligation (weak or strong), or command.

Epistemic meanings answer the question “How do you know?”, while deontic meanings answer the questions “What should I do?” Epistemic modality relates to the entire proposition: *It may rain* = ‘it is possible that it will rain’. Deontic modality is subject-oriented: *You may leave the table* = ‘you are permitted to leave the table’ (Brinton and Brinton, 2010, p. 167-168). According to Kosour (2010), deontic modality has a circumstantial modal base (because one may have to abstract away from one’s knowledge that the right thing will not be done) and an ordering source based on a body of laws or principles.

Concerning the different realizations of epistemic modality, “Modality is signified in a range of linguistic forms: centrally, with the modal auxiliary verbs may,
shall, must, need, and others; with sentence adverbs such as probably, certainly, regrettably; and with adjectives such as necessary, unfortunate, certain. Some verbs, and many nominalizations, are essentially modal: permit, predict, and prove; obligation, likelihood, desirability, authority.” (Fowler, 1985, p. 73). In other words, the study of epistemic modality in political discourse deals with the speaker’s position and inner-self in his talk. In my research, the main interest is epistemic modality in order to show how Tony Blair uses it in order to assert his knowledge about war on Iraq. That is, Tony Blair’s use of epistemic modality within his public speeches about War in Iraq can unveil his objective or subjective voice in the issue.

2.5 Quirk et al’s approach to CDA

Quirk et al (1985) define modality as “the manner in which the meaning of a clause is qualified so as to reflect the speaker’s judgment of the likelihood of the proposition it expresses being true” (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 219). Concurring with that, Huddleston & Pullum (2003) argue that epistemic modality qualifies the speaker’s loyalty to the reality of the modalized proposition. Quirk et al (1985) make the distinction between two major types of modality: “In place of intrinsic and extrinsic modality, other terminologies, such as modulation and modality, root and epistemic modality, are widespread” (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 220). So, according to them, epistemic modality can be referred to as ‘modality’ or extrinsic modality.

Quirk et al (1985) identify the central modal auxiliaries as follows “can, could, may, might, shall, should, will, would, must” (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 137). These epistemic auxiliaries hold the meaning of epistemic possibility. Quirk et al (1985) distinguish between three groups of modal auxiliaries which are as follows:

**Group one:**

- Can/could; there are three major meanings of these modals can be distinguished; possibility, ability and permission.
- May/might; there are two major meanings of these modals; possibility and permission.
Group two:

- Must; logical necessity
- Need/ have got to; obligation and logical necessity
- Ought to/ should; tentative inference and obligation

Group three:

- Will/would; prediction and volition
- Shall; prediction

(Quirk et al, 1985, p. 221-230)

Quirk et al (1985) argue about the issue of tense and epistemic modal auxiliaries. “Although historically, most of the modals can be paired into past and non past forms (can/could, may/might, will/would, shall/should), the ‘past tense’ forms are only in some respects usefully classified as such from the point of view of meaning” (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 220). In other words, the epistemic dimension, as it holds subjectivity on the part of the speaker, is stronger than tense effect on these modal auxiliaries. In the same vein, Quirk et al (1985) maintain that

There is no future tense in English; it is useful at this point to consider the most important constructions for expressing future time, particularly in dependent clauses. Futurity, modality and aspect are closely interrelated, and this reflected in the fact that the future time is rendered by means of modal auxiliaries, by semi-auxiliaries, or by the simple present or present progressive forms. (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 213).

So, the past and the future tenses as well as modality cannot be dissociated from each other. That is, they are interrelated and it is quite difficult to make a distinction between them.

Quirk et al (1985) maintain that epistemic modality has to do with subjectivity. “Although shall and, particularly, will are the closest approximations to a colourless,
neutral future they do cover a range of meanings with modal colouring” (Quirk et al, 1985, p. 213). Hence, the presence of epistemic modality is a clear piece of evidence about the speaker’s voice in a proposition.

To conclude, Quirk et al’s approach insists on the subjective aspect in a proposition in case of epistemic modality. Moreover, they claim that the reader cannot make the distinction between the different aspects in a proposition such as past and future tenses as well as modality. As such, the presence of modal tools within discourse can influence it. Modality in text is a sort of the speaker’s intervention in it. Within the same framework, Halliday (2004) insists, in his approach, on the subjective aspect in a proposition in case of the usage of epistemic modality by the speaker.

3. Methodology

In this section, the methodology used to analyze the use of modal auxiliaries in the corpus will be described in detail. The first part focuses on the quantitative analysis of the corpus. The second section presents the qualitative research instruments analyses.

3.1 Quantitative Research Instruments

The quantitative analysis is based on the application of a statistical method to get numerical figures. This type of analysis is used in order to get exact information. The quantitative analysis is useful for text study. It changes textual data to obtain numerical data. Triki and Sellami-Baklouti (2002, p. 37) state that quantitative linguistics is based on the use of a quantitative analysis to make a precise study of language. In this respect, I will try to make a quantitative analysis of the frequency of occurrence of the different tools of epistemic modality in the selected corpus.

3.1.1. Frequency Distributions

The numerical approach consists in counting the number of occurrences of epistemic modality (auxiliaries, verbs, adverbs, adjectives, nouns) and their variants in Tony Blair’s speech under study. Then, the frequency of epistemic modality will be put in a table and a chart in order to better display the different occurrences of epistemic modality in the corpus under study.
The frequency distribution of epistemic modality is expected to give a clear idea about its frequent use. In other words, the frequency of epistemic modality should say a lot about the speaker’s voice in his discourse. Depending on the degree of certitude in the studied corpus, the speaker’s orientation in his speech can be concluded. It should be noted that the different tools of epistemic modality are searched for in both forms: positive and negative all together. Microsoft Excel will be used to put the findings into charts, histograms, etc.

3.1.2. Measures of Central Tendencies

Triki and Sellami-Baklouti maintain that the quantitative analysis is used to measure “the range of values around which the data typically cluster” (Triki and Sellami-Baklouti, 2002, p. 50). The mean, the median and the mode are methods to get precise results about the average of the presence of variables. In fact, after counting the frequency of each means of epistemic modality, the mean is used to compute the occurrence of each type of epistemic modality in the sum total of political speeches.

The mean can be obtained according to the following formula:

$$\bar{x} = \frac{\sum x}{N}$$

That is “the mean $\bar{x}$ is the quotient of the sum of all the values of $x$ by the total number of observations” (Triki and Sellami-Baklouti, 2002, p. 50)

Where

- $x$ is any of the numbers whose mean is computed.
- $\sum x$ is the sum of all $x$s
- $N$ is the total number of observations.

The mean is used to determine the type of epistemic device that is most frequently used in the corpus. The measures of the mean of each type of epistemic modality will be put in a table and then these measures will be provided into graphical representations. This is expected to provide the readers with clear results about the frequency distribution of modal tools in the corpus.

3.2 Qualitative Research Instruments
The numerical results obtained will be studied qualitatively. The qualitative method will be used so as to examine and argue about how the use of epistemic modality is a strategy of political manipulation and a tool to exercise power.

This research intends to show that the use of epistemic modality is planned by the speaker in order to avoid specific statements and exactness in discourse. In other words, modality is a tricky method used by Blair in order to avoid precision about the real motives behind his country’s taking part in the Iraqi war.

The different tools of epistemic modality which are going to be searched in this paper are indicated in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modal auxiliaries</th>
<th>Modal verbs</th>
<th>Modal adverbs</th>
<th>Modal adjectives</th>
<th>Modal nouns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>can</td>
<td>seem</td>
<td>certainly</td>
<td>certain</td>
<td>the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>could</td>
<td>prove</td>
<td>clearly</td>
<td>clear</td>
<td>possibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>may</td>
<td>look</td>
<td>probably</td>
<td>probable</td>
<td>the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>might</td>
<td>appear</td>
<td>evidently</td>
<td>evident</td>
<td>likelihood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>must</td>
<td>think</td>
<td>obviously</td>
<td>obvious</td>
<td>the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shall</td>
<td>believe</td>
<td>possibly</td>
<td>possible</td>
<td>probability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>should</td>
<td>assum</td>
<td>necessarily</td>
<td>obligatory</td>
<td>the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>will</td>
<td>e</td>
<td>surely</td>
<td>necessary</td>
<td>evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>would</td>
<td>y</td>
<td></td>
<td>sure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: The Framework used in the Corpus Analysis (Adapted from Halliday, 2004)

4. Findings and Results

The findings obtained from the quantitative and qualitative analysis are set in the following diagram and table.

4.1. Frequency Distributions results

The results obtained from the statistical calculation of the occurrence of modal auxiliaries in the selected corpus are presented in the following table.
It is noted, in the table and the diagram, that the most frequent modal auxiliary in the corpus is WILL. The occurrence of WILL is a sign of authority and certainty in the discourse of Blair about war on Iraq. The evidentiality in the discourse of the speaker is mainly attributed to an apparent certainty about the existence of weapons of mass destruction in Iraq. Other modal auxiliaries such as CAN and WOULD are also frequently used in the studied corpus.

Tony Blair uses WILL, CAN and WOULD in order to maintain his sovereignty as a political leader who appears very sure when talking about war in Iraq and the fundamental British role to maintain peace and freedom in this country. Also, this chart shows that the occurrence of modal auxiliaries expressing possibility such as MAY and MIGHT is very low. The speaker does not appear as hesitant but rather sure when talking about his country’s taking part in this war. So, it can be concluded through the quantitative analysis of epistemic auxiliaries that Blair seems to be
confident in his decision to wage war in Iraq. This idea is discussed by van Dijk (2008) who associates the use of modality with the concept of knowledge “in his speech he can be more or less sure about WMD in Iraq. For a study of knowledge in discourse, and especially in political speeches, it is therefore relevant to examine the (alethic) modality of its propositions” (van Dijk, 2008, p. 33).

To conclude, the quantitative analysis of the corpus shows the high level of frequency distribution of some modal auxiliaries such as WILL, SHOULD, WOULD and MUST. This apparently shows certainty and confidence on the part of the speaker. But, the use of modal auxiliaries are employed to say that the choice of war is ‘inevitable’. This comes even though the speaker

4.2 Qualitative findings

In this section, the qualitative analysis focuses on the modal auxiliaries which are highly present in the corps (see the quantitative findings section.) these modal auxiliaries are WILL, CAN, COULD, MUST and SHOULD.

4.2.1. The modal auxiliary WILL

The use of the modal auxiliary WILL is quite high in this corpus (see the quantitative findings section). This indicates a great deal of self-confidence from the part of the speaker. The following example may clarify this idea:

(1)”Because the outcome of this issue will now determine more than the fate of the Iraqi regime…. It will determine the way Britain and the world confront the central security threat of the 21st century…. It will determine the pattern of international politics for the next generation.”

Here it is important to presence of WILL as a convincing device. It should be noticed that the presence of the modal auxiliary WILL reflects primarily the speaker’s opinion concerning the issue. In other words, epistemic modality’s realization, in this corpus, translates the subjectivity of the speaker when dealing with the debate of war (van Dijk, 2008). To put it differently, the use of epistemic modality is employed to manage the relation between public discourse and management of knowledge (Facchinetti, Krug & Palmer, 2003 In van Dijk,2008, p. 14) )
4.2.2 The modal auxiliary CAN

CAN is used by Blair to speak about the negative consequences that may happen in case there are Weapons of Mass Destruction in Iraq. The use of CAN is associated here with the possibility of destruction. In other words, Blair uses epistemic modality (high probability) to draw bad images about the future in the case of the existence of WMD. This is clearly shown in the extract below:

(2)“I can think of many things, of whether we summon the strength to recognize the global challenge of the 21st century and beat it, of the Iraqi people groaning under years of dictatorship, of our armed forces - brave men and women of whom we can feel proud, whose morale is high and whose purpose is clear”

In these extracts, Blair uses the epistemic modal auxiliary CAN in association with his knowledge about the Iraqi people as well as some historical events. Faced with criticism and disagreement about his country’s military action in Iraq, Blair wants to convince his audience about the necessity of this war in order to avoid the expected problems which may happen in case Britain does not intervene in this war.

4.2.3 The modal auxiliary COULD

Using the modal auxiliary verb COULD is meant by Tony Blair to describe the horrific results of using nuclear weapons. The following excerpts may make the idea clear.

(3) “Based on unaccounted for growth media, Iraq’s potential production of anthrax could have been in the range of about 15,000 to 25,000 liters ...”

The epistemic modal auxiliary COULD is put by the speaker so as to describe the destructive power of Weapons of Mass Destruction held by Iraq. In other words, the presence of COULD is mainly meant to maintain power and sovereignty by the speaker in the corpus under study. Also, it can be noticed that the use of COULD is not frequent in the corpus studied because the speaker’s ultimate objective is to appear confident.

4.2.4 The Epistemic Modal Auxiliary MUST
The use of the modal auxiliary **MUST** is meant to express necessity and obligation by the speaker. Blair uses **MUST** to attack publicly Saddam Hussein and his regime. This idea is evidenced by the following extract:

(4) “We **must** face the consequences of the actions we advocate. For me, that means all the dangers of war. But for others, opposed to this course, it means - let us be clear - that the Iraqi people, whose only true hope of liberation lies in the removal of Saddam, for them, the darkness will close back over them again; and he will be free to take his revenge upon those he **must** know wish him gone”

In these extract, Blair tries to convince people about the necessity of war. He describes his country's participation in this war as a religious mission. That is why; war is a must and an obligation for him.

**4.2.5. The Epistemic Modal Auxiliary SHOULD**

The modal auxiliary **SHOULD** is used to convey the validity of what the speaker is saying in the future. It stands for power and sovereignty in political discourse. Tony Blair uses **SHOULD** as a strategy showing his leadership position in the war. This is illustrated below

(5) “Faced with it, the world **should** unite. The UN **should** be the focus, both of diplomacy and of action.”

In this extract, the use of **SHOULD** makes the audience of Blair share with him the decision of declaring war. This is a manipulative strategy used by the speaker to minimize his responsibility concerning this especially in case that it is proves to be a wrong decision.

Blair uses the modal auxiliary **SHOULD** to get his people involved in the decision of declaring war against Iraq. Also, the use of **SHOULD** reflects the speaker’s objective to assert his knowledge about the existence of WMD in Iraq, which makes his intervention a necessity.
To sum up, the qualitative analysis of modal auxiliaries reflect the strategic plan of the speaker to get the parliamentary agreement to wage the war. This goes hand in hand with the notion of knowledge. In his claim about modality in political discourse, van Dijk (2008, p. 14) argues that "Events and knowledge about such events may be presented as modalized in several ways, for instance as certain (necessary), probable or possible — depending again on the interests of the authors." This stresses the intention of the speaker behind the (dis) emphasis of some modal auxiliaries.

5. Conclusion:

The modal auxiliaries are more noticeable in the studied corpus than the other types of epistemic modality. Auxiliaries such as WILL, WOULD and CAN reflect willingness and authority by the Blair. The latter shows a great deal of sureness when talking about Weapons of Mass Destruction. The way he talks about this type of weapons leaves no doubt for his audience to believe him and consequently be convinced. So, the excessive use of epistemic modality for evidentiality has to be taken with care since it has been discovered later that there is no existence of such weapons in Iraq. Furthermore, the modalization aspect expressing certitude is implicitly expressed especially through the modal auxiliaries such as WILL. It is apparently inserted for the future tense meaning but this dimension is only secondary. The major objective behind the insertion of modal auxiliaries is to put pressure on audience to get their approval about the war. This pressure is indirectly achieved by meanings of certitude, power and domination. Also, certainty in the discourse of Blair appears when he talks to his audience about the importance of being united with the USA so as to defeat their enemy. According to him, putting an end to Saddam Hussein’s regime is the key to achieve security and democracy for Iraqi people.

References


Appendix:

This is the text of Prime Minister Tony Blair’s speech on the Iraq crisis in the house of Commons, as released by 10 Downing Street.

Tuesday 18 March 2003 15.34 GMT

I beg to move the motion standing on the order paper in my name and those of my right honorable friends.

At the outset I say: it is right that this house debate this issue and pass judgment. That is the democracy that is our right but that others struggle for in vain.

And again I say: I do not disrespect the views of those in opposition to mine.
This is a tough choice. But it is also a stark one: to stand British troops down and turn back; or to hold firm to the course we have set.

I believe we must hold firm.

The question most often posed is not why does it matter? But why does it matter so much? Here we are, the government with its most serious test, its majority at risk, the first cabinet resignation over an issue of policy. The main parties divided.

People who agree on everything else, disagree on this and likewise, those who never agree on anything, finding common cause. The country and parliament reflect each other, a debate that, as time has gone on has become less bitter but not less grave.

So: why does it matter so much? Because the outcome of this issue will now determine more than the fate of the Iraqi regime and more than the future of the Iraqi people, for so long brutalised by Saddam. It will determine the way Britain and the world confront the central security threat of the 21st century; the development of the UN; the relationship between Europe and the US; the relations within the EU and the way the US engages with the rest of the world. It will determine the pattern of international politics for the next generation.

But first, Iraq and its WMD.

In April 1991, after the Gulf war, Iraq was given 15 days to provide a full and final declaration of all its WMD.

Saddam had used the weapons against Iran, against his own people, causing thousands of deaths. He had had plans to use them against allied forces. It became clear after the Gulf war that the WMD ambitions of Iraq were far more extensive than hitherto thought. This issue was identified by the UN as one for urgent remedy. UNSCOM, the weapons inspection team, was set up. They were expected to complete their task following the declaration at the end of April 1991.

The declaration when it came was false - a blanket denial of the programme, other than in a very tentative form. So the 12-year game began.

The inspectors probed. Finally in March 1992, Iraq admitted it had previously undeclared WMD but said it had destroyed them. It gave another full and final declaration. Again the inspectors probed but found little.

In October 1994, Iraq stopped cooperating with UNSCOM altogether. Military action was threatened. Inspections resumed. In March 1995, in an effort to rid Iraq of the inspectors, a further full and final declaration of WMD was made. By July 1995, Iraq was forced to admit that too was false. In August they provided yet another full and final declaration.

Then, a week later, Saddam's son-in-law, Hussein Kamal, defected to Jordan. He disclosed a far more extensive BW (biological weapons) programme and for the first time said Iraq had weaponised the programme; something Saddam had always strenuously denied. All this had been happening whilst the inspectors were in Iraq. Kamal also revealed Iraq's crash programme to produce a nuclear weapon in 1990.
Iraq was forced then to release documents which showed just how extensive those programmes were. In November 1995, Jordan intercepted prohibited components for missiles that could be used for WMD.

In June 1996, a further full and final declaration was made. That too turned out to be false. In June 1997, inspectors were barred from specific sites.

In September 1997, another full and final declaration was made. Also false. Meanwhile the inspectors discovered VX nerve agent production equipment, something always denied by the Iraqis.

In October 1997, the US and the UK threatened military action if Iraq refused to comply with the inspectors. But obstruction continued.

Finally, under threat of action, in February 1998, Kofi Annan went to Baghdad and negotiated a memorandum with Saddam to allow inspections to continue. They did. For a few months.

In August, cooperation was suspended.

In December the inspectors left. Their final report is a withering indictment of Saddam’s lies, deception and obstruction, with large quantities of WMD remained unaccounted for.

The US and the UK then, in December 1998, undertook Desert Fox, a targeted bombing campaign to degrade as much of the Iraqi WMD facilities as we could.

In 1999, a new inspections team, Unmovic, was set up. But Saddam refused to allow them to enter Iraq.

So there they stayed, in limbo, until after resolution 1441 when last November they were allowed to return.

What is the claim of Saddam today? Why exactly the same claim as before: that he has no WMD. Indeed we are asked to believe that after seven years of obstruction and non-compliance finally resulting in the inspectors leaving in 1998, seven years in which he hid his programme, built it up even whilst inspection teams were in Iraq, that after they left he then voluntarily decided to do what he had consistently refused to do under coercion.

When the inspectors left in 1998, they left unaccounted for: 10,000 litres of anthrax; a far reaching VX nerve agent programme; up to 6,500 chemical munitions; at least 80 tonnes of mustard gas, possibly more than ten times that amount; unquantifiable amounts of sarin, botulinum toxin and a host of other biological poisons; an entire Scud missile programme.

We are now seriously asked to accept that in the last few years, contrary to all history, contrary to all intelligence, he decided unilaterally to destroy the weapons. Such a claim is palpably absurd.

1441 is a very clear resolution. It lays down a final opportunity for Saddam to disarm. It rehearses the fact that he has been, for years in material breach of 17 separate UN resolutions. It says that this time compliance must be full, unconditional and immediate. The first step is a full and final declaration of all WMD to be given on 8 December.

I won’t to go through all the events since then - the house is familiar with them - but this much is accepted by all members of the UNSC: the 8 December declaration is false. That in itself is a material breach. Iraq has made some concessions to cooperation but no-one disputes it is not fully cooperating.
Iraq continues to deny it has any WMD, though no serious intelligence service anywhere in the world believes them.

On 7 March, the inspectors published a remarkable document. It is 173 pages long, detailing all the unanswered questions about Iraq's WMD. It lists 29 different areas where they have been unable to obtain information. For example, on VX it says: "Documentation available to Unmovic suggests that Iraq at least had had far reaching plans to weaponise VX ...

"Mustard constituted an important part (about 70%) of Iraq's CW arsenal ... 550 mustard filled shells and up to 450 mustard filled aerial bombs unaccounted for ... additional uncertainty with respect of 6526 aerial bombs, corresponding to approximately 1000 tonnes of agent, predominantly mustard.

"Based on unaccounted for growth media, Iraq's potential production of anthrax could have been in the range of about 15,000 to 25,000 litres ... Based on all the available evidence, the strong presumption is that about 10,000 litres of anthrax was not destroyed and may still exist."

On this basis, had we meant what we said in resolution 1441, the security council should have convened and condemned Iraq as in material breach.

What is perfectly clear is that Saddam is playing the same old games in the same old way. Yes there are concessions. But no fundamental change of heart or mind.

But the inspectors indicated there was at least some cooperation; and the world rightly hesitated over war. We therefore approached a second resolution in this way.

We laid down an ultimatum calling upon Saddam to come into line with resolution 1441 or be in material breach. Not an unreasonable proposition, given the history.

But still countries hesitated: how do we know how to judge full cooperation?

We then worked on a further compromise. We consulted the inspectors and drew up five tests based on the document they published on 7 March. Tests like interviews with 30 scientists outside of Iraq; production of the anthrax or documentation showing its destruction.

The inspectors added another test: that Saddam should publicly call on Iraqis to cooperate with them. So we constructed this framework: that Saddam should be given a specified time to fulfil all six tests to show full cooperation; that if he did so the inspectors could then set out a forward work programme and that if he failed to do so, action would follow.

So clear benchmarks; plus a clear ultimatum. I defy anyone to describe that as an unreasonable position.

Last Monday, we were getting somewhere with it. We very nearly had majority agreement and I thank the Chilean President particularly for the constructive way he approached the issue.

There were debates about the length of the ultimatum. But the basic construct was gathering support.

Then, on Monday night, France said it would veto a second resolution whatever the circumstances. Then France denounced the six tests. Later that day, Iraq rejected them. Still, we continued to negotiate.
Last Friday, France said they could not accept any ultimatum. On Monday, we made final efforts to secure agreement. But they remain utterly opposed to anything which lays down an ultimatum authorising action in the event of non-compliance by Saddam.

Just consider the position we are asked to adopt. Those on the security council opposed to us say they want Saddam to disarm but will not countenance any new resolution that authorises force in the event of non-compliance.

So we must demand he disarm but relinquish any concept of a threat if he doesn’t. From December 1998 to December 2002, no UN inspector was allowed to inspect anything in Iraq. For four years, not a thing.

What changed his mind? The threat of force. From December to January and then from January through to February, concessions were made.

What changed his mind? The threat of force. And what makes him now issue invitations to the inspectors, discover documents he said he never had, produce evidence of weapons supposed to be non-existent, destroy missiles he said he would keep? The imminence of force.

The only persuasive power to which he responds is 250,000 allied troops on his doorstep.

And yet when that fact is so obvious that it is staring us in the face, we are told that any resolution that authorises force will be vetoed. Not just opposed. Vetoed. Blocked.

The way ahead was so clear. It was for the UN to pass a second resolution setting out benchmarks for compliance; with an ultimatum that if they were ignored, action would follow.

The tragedy is that had such a resolution issued, he might just have complied. Because the only route to peace with someone like Saddam Hussein is diplomacy backed by force.

Yet the moment we proposed the benchmarks, canvassed support for an ultimatum, there was an immediate recourse to the language of the veto.

And now the world has to learn the lesson all over again that weakness in the face of a threat from a tyrant, is the surest way not to peace but to war.

Looking back over 12 years, we have been victims of our own desire to placate the implacable, to persuade towards reason the utterly unreasonable, to hope that there was some genuine intent to do good in a regime whose mind is in fact evil. Now the very length of time counts against us. You’ve waited 12 years. Why not wait a little longer?

And indeed we have.

1441 gave a final opportunity. The first test was the 8th of December. He failed it. But still we waited. Until January 27, the first inspection report that showed the absence of full cooperation. Another breach. And still we waited.

Until February 14 and then February 28 with concessions, according to the old familiar routine, tossed to us to whet our appetite for hope and further waiting. But still no-one, not the inspectors nor any member of the security council, not any half-way rational observer, believes Saddam is cooperating fully or unconditionally or immediately.

Our fault has not been impatience.
The truth is our patience should have been exhausted weeks and months and years ago. Even now, when if the world united and gave him an ultimatum: comply or face forcible disarmament, he might just do it, the world hesitates and in that hesitation he senses the weakness and therefore continues to defy.

What would any tyrannical regime possessing WMD think viewing the history of the world's diplomatic dance with Saddam? That our capacity to pass firm resolutions is only matched by our feebleness in implementing them.

That is why this indulgence has to stop. Because it is dangerous. It is dangerous if such regimes disbelieve us.

Dangerous if they think they can use our weakness, our hesitation, even the natural urges of our democracy towards peace, against us.

Dangerous because one day they will mistake our innate revulsion against war for permanent incapacity; when in fact, pushed to the limit, we will act.

But then when we act, after years of pretence, the action will have to be harder, bigger, more total in its impact. Iraq is not the only regime with WMD. But back away now from this confrontation and future conflicts will be infinitely worse and more devastating.

But, of course, in a sense, any fair observer does not really dispute that Iraq is in breach and that 1441 implies action in such circumstances. The real problem is that, underneath, people dispute that Iraq is a threat; dispute the link between terrorism and WMD; dispute the whole basis of our assertion that the two together constitute a fundamental assault on our way of life.

There are glib and sometimes foolish comparisons with the 1930s. No one here is an appeaser. But the only relevant point of analogy is that with history, we know what happened. We can look back and say: there's the time; that was the moment; for example, when Czechoslovakia was swallowed up by the Nazis - that's when we should have acted.

But it wasn't clear at the time. In fact at the time, many people thought such a fear fanciful. Worse, put forward in bad faith by warmongers. Listen to this editorial - from a paper I'm pleased to say with a different position today - but written in late 1938 after Munich when by now, you would have thought the world was tumultuous in its desire to act.

"Be glad in your hearts. Give thanks to your God. People of Britain, your children are safe. Your husbands and your sons will not march to war. Peace is a victory for all mankind. And now let us go back to our own affairs. We have had enough of those menaces, conjured up from the continent to confuse us."

Naturally should Hitler appear again in the same form, we would know what to do. But the point is that history doesn't declare the future to us so plainly. Each time is different and the present must be judged without the benefit of hindsight.

So let me explain the nature of this threat as I see it.
The threat today is not that of the 1930s. It's not big powers going to war with each other. The ravages which fundamentalist political ideology inflicted on the 20th century are memories. The Cold war is over. Europe is at peace, if not always diplomatically.

But the world is ever more interdependent. Stock markets and economies rise and fall together. Confidence is the key to prosperity. Insecurity spreads like contagion. So people crave stability and order.

The threat is chaos. And there are two begetters of chaos. Tyrannical regimes with WMD and extreme terrorist groups who profess a perverted and false view of Islam.

Let me tell the house what I know. I know that there are some countries or groups within countries that are proliferating and trading in WMD, especially nuclear weapons technology.

I know there are companies, individuals, some former scientists on nuclear weapons programmes, selling their equipment or expertise.

I know there are several countries - mostly dictatorships with highly repressive regimes - desperately trying to acquire chemical weapons, biological weapons or, in particular, nuclear weapons capability. Some of these countries are now a short time away from having a serviceable nuclear weapon. This activity is not diminishing. It is increasing.

We all know that there are terrorist cells now operating in most major countries. Just as in the last two years, around 20 different nations have suffered serious terrorist outrages. Thousands have died in them.

The purpose of terrorism lies not just in the violent act itself. It is in producing terror. It sets out to inflame, to divide, to produce consequences which they then use to justify further terror.

Round the world it now poisons the chances of political progress: in the Middle East; in Kashmir; in Chechnya; in Africa.

The removal of the Taliban in Afghanistan dealt it a blow. But it has not gone away. And these two threats have different motives and different origins but they share one basic common view: they detest the freedom, democracy and tolerance that are the hallmarks of our way of life.

At the moment, I accept that association between them is loose. But it is hardening. And the possibility of the two coming together - of terrorist groups in possession of WMD, even of a so-called dirty radiological bomb is now, in my judgement, a real and present danger.

And let us recall: what was shocking about September 11 was not just the slaughter of the innocent; but the knowledge that had the terrorists been able to, there would have been not 3,000 innocent dead, but 30,000 or 300,000 and the more the suffering, the greater the terrorists' rejoicing.

Three kilograms of VX from a rocket launcher would contaminate a quarter of a square kilometre of a city.

Millions of lethal doses are contained in one litre of Anthrax. 10,000 litres are unaccounted for. 11 September has changed the psychology of America. It should have changed the psychology of the
world. Of course Iraq is not the only part of this threat. But it is the test of whether we treat the threat seriously.

   Faced with it, the world should unite. The UN should be the focus, both of diplomacy and of action. That is what 1441 said. That was the deal. And I say to you to break it now, to will the ends but not the means that would do more damage in the long term to the UN than any other course.

   To fall back into the lassitude of the last 12 years, to talk, to discuss, to debate but never act; to declare our will but not enforce it; to combine strong language with weak intentions, a worse outcome than never speaking at all.

   And then, when the threat returns from Iraq or elsewhere, who will believe us? What price our credibility with the next tyrant? No wonder Japan and South Korea, next to North Korea, has issued such strong statements of support.

   I have come to the conclusion after much reluctance that the greater danger to the UN is inaction: that to pass resolution 1441 and then refuse to enforce it would do the most deadly damage to the UN's future strength, confirming it as an instrument of diplomacy but not of action, forcing nations down the very unilateralist path we wish to avoid.

   But there will be, in any event, no sound future for the UN, no guarantee against the repetition of these events, unless we recognise the urgent need for a political agenda we can unite upon.

   What we have witnessed is indeed the consequence of Europe and the United States dividing from each other. Not all of Europe - Spain, Italy, Holland, Denmark, Portugal - have all strongly supported us. And not a majority of Europe if we include, as we should, Europe's new members who will accede next year, all 10 of whom have been in our support.

   But the paralysis of the UN has been born out of the division there is. And at the heart of it has been the concept of a world in which there are rival poles of power. The US and its allies in one corner. France, Germany, Russia and its allies in the other. I do not believe that all of these nations intend such an outcome. But that is what now faces us.

   I believe such a vision to be misguided and profoundly dangerous. I know why it arises. There is resentment of US predominance.

   There is fear of US unilateralism. People ask: do the US listen to us and our preoccupations? And there is perhaps a lack of full understanding of US preoccupations after 11th September. I know all of this. But the way to deal with it is not rivalry but partnership. Partners are not servants but neither are they rivals. I tell you what Europe should have said last September to the US. With one voice it should have said: we understand your strategic anxiety over terrorism and WMD and we will help you meet it. We will mean what we say in any UN resolution we pass and will back it with action if Saddam fails to disarm voluntarily; but in return we ask two things of you: that the US should choose the UN path and you should recognise the fundamental overriding importance of re-starting the MEPP (Middle East Peace Process), which we will hold you to.

   I do not believe there is any other issue with the same power to re-unite the world community than progress on the issues of Israel and Palestine. Of course there is cynicism about recent
announcements. But the US is now committed, and, I believe genuinely, to the roadmap for peace, designed in consultation with the UN. It will now be presented to the parties as Abu Mazen is confirmed in office, hopefully today.

All of us are now signed up to its vision: a state of Israel, recognised and accepted by all the world, and a viable Palestinian state. And that should be part of a larger global agenda. On poverty and sustainable development. On democracy and human rights. On the good governance of nations.

That is why what happens after any conflict in Iraq is of such critical significance.

Here again there is a chance to unify around the UN. Let me make it clear.

There should be a new UN resolution following any conflict providing not just for humanitarian help but also for the administration and governance of Iraq. That must now be done under proper UN authorisation.

It should protect totally the territorial integrity of Iraq. And let the oil revenues - which people falsely claim we want to seize - be put in a trust fund for the Iraqi people administered through the UN.

And let the future government of Iraq be given the chance to begin the process of uniting the nation’s disparate groups, on a democratic basis, respecting human rights, as indeed the fledgling democracy in Northern Iraq - protected from Saddam for 12 years by British and American pilots in the no-fly zone - has done so remarkably.

And the moment that a new government is in place - willing to disarm Iraq of WMD - for which its people have no need or purpose - then let sanctions be lifted in their entirety.

I have never put our justification for action as regime change. We have to act within the terms set out in resolution 1441. That is our legal base.

But it is the reason, I say frankly, why if we do act we should do so with a clear conscience and strong heart.

I accept fully that those opposed to this course of action share my detestation of Saddam. Who could not? Iraq is a wealthy country that in 1978, the year before Saddam seized power, was richer than Portugal or Malaysia.

Today it is impoverished, 60% of its population dependent on food aid.

Thousands of children die needlessly every year from lack of food and medicine.

Four million people out of a population of just over 20 million are in exile.

The brutality of the repression - the death and torture camps, the barbaric prisons for political opponents, the routine beatings for anyone or their families suspected of disloyalty are well documented.

Just last week, someone slandering Saddam was tied to a lamp post in a street in Baghdad, his tongue cut out, mutilated and left to bleed to death, as a warning to others.

I recall a few weeks ago talking to an Iraqi exile and saying to her that I understood how grim it must be under the lash of Saddam.

"But you don’t", she replied. "You cannot. You do not know what it is like to live in perpetual fear."
And she is right. We take our freedom for granted. But imagine not to be able to speak or discuss or debate or even question the society you live in. To see friends and family taken away and never daring to complain. To suffer the humility of failing courage in face of pitiless terror. That is how the Iraqi people live. Leave Saddam in place and that is how they will continue to live.

We must face the consequences of the actions we advocate. For me, that means all the dangers of war. But for others, opposed to this course, it means - let us be clear - that the Iraqi people, whose only true hope of liberation lies in the removal of Saddam, for them, the darkness will close back over them again; and he will be free to take his revenge upon those he must know wish him gone.

And if this house now demands that at this moment, faced with this threat from this regime, that British troops are pulled back, that we turn away at the point of reckoning, and that is what it means - what then?

What will Saddam feel? Strengthened beyond measure. What will the other states who tyrannise their people, the terrorists who threaten our existence, what will they take from that? That the will confronting them is decaying and feeble.

Who will celebrate and who will weep?

And if our plea is for America to work with others, to be good as well as powerful allies, will our retreat make them multilateralist? Or will it not rather be the biggest impulse to unilateralism there could ever be. And what of the UN and the future of Iraq and the Middle East peace plan, devoid of our influence, stripped of our insistence?

This house wanted this decision. Well it has it. Those are the choices. And in this dilemma, no choice is perfect, no cause ideal.

But on this decision hangs the fate of many things:

Of whether we summon the strength to recognise this global challenge of the 21st century and meet it.

Of the Iraqi people, groaning under years of dictatorship.

Of our armed forces - brave men and women of whom we can feel proud, whose morale is high and whose purpose is clear:

Of the institutions and alliances that will shape our world for years to come."

I can think of many things, of whether we summon the strength to recognise the global challenge of the 21st century and beat it, of the Iraqi people groaning under years of dictatorship, of our armed forces - brave men and women of whom we can feel proud, whose morale is high and whose purpose is clear - of the institutions and alliances that shape our world for years to come.

To retreat now, I believe, would put at hazard all that we hold dearest, turn the UN back into a talking shop, stifle the first steps of progress in the Middle East; leave the Iraqi people to the mercy of events on which we would have relinquished all power to influence for the better.

Tell our allies that at the very moment of action, at the very moment when they need our determination that Britain faltered. I will not be party to such a course. This is not the time to falter. This is the time for this house, not just this government or indeed this prime minister, but for this
house to give a lead, to show that we will stand up for what we know to be right, to show that we will confront the tyrannies and dictatorships and terrorists who put our way of life at risk, to show at the moment of decision that we have the courage to do the right thing.

I beg to move the motion.
Re-thinking Religious Text Translation: A Conceptual Framework for an Interdisciplinary Translation of the Qur’an

By Mhammed Krifa

Abstract

More than a dozen of translations of the Qur’an are available in the English language alone, with each claiming to be a better and more accurate rendering of the source text than its predecessors. Examples include George Sale’s *The Al Koran of Mohammed* (1880), Dawood’s *The Koran* (1956) Arberry’s *The Koran Interpreted* (1957), Yusuf Ali’s *The THE HOLY QUR’AN* (1989) and Laleh Bakhtiar’s *The Sublime Quran* (2009). Except for a few translations that have recently been carried out in the form of a group work and yet remain the fruit of translators belonging to the same background, usually a linguistic one, all the remaining translations are achieved on an individual basis and are consequently affected by the translator’s ideological stance and sectarian affiliation.\(^{17}\)

It is, therefore, important to develop a conceptual framework for the translation of the Qur’an following an interdisciplinary approach based on supra-disciplinary collaboration that transcends traditional disciplinary boundaries. The paper discusses the benefits of such a framework and uses it as a background for the

\(^{17}\) An example of a recent group translation is *Quran: A Reformist Translation* by Edip Yuksel, Layth Salah al-Shaiban and Martha Schulte-Nafeh
evaluation of some of the available translations focusing on some disputed Qur’anic verses among exegetes and translators.

**Keywords:**
Qur’an Translation Studies, uni-disciplinarity, cross-disciplinarity, multidisciplinarity, transdisciplinarity, interdisciplinarity, ideology, sectarian affiliation.

**1. Introduction**

The 1960’s witnessed the rise of interdisciplinary research in the field of humanities. This phenomenon has greatly affected the translation exercise which, according to Alavi (2012) “is no longer perceived as an innocent transfer of semantic meaning across linguistic borders” where “the ideological and political implications of representing or rather, constructing an image of the other, i.e. texts, actions, rituals, works of art, etc., within the receiving culture have allowed disciplines such as anthropology, post colonial and gender studies to make use of translation as an analytical and descriptive tool” (p.25). Although the translator's ideological stance applies to all types of texts, it is more obvious in the case of religious canonical texts.

Whereas other fields have benefited from interdisciplinarity (henceforth referred to as ID), translations of the Qur'an remain carried out by individuals on a uni-disciplinary basis. Even in case the translation is provided in the form of a team work it remains achieved by a group of people who belong to the same field of specialty, usually a linguistic one.

In this article, I shall discuss the disadvantages of uni-disciplinary translations of the Qu’ran and will propose an ID model instead.

**2. Research Problem**

While almost all Muslim scholars believe that the Qur'an is untranslatable due to its divine nature and “i’jâz”19, they, however, allow the interpretive or exegetical

---

18 We understand ideology to mean the assumptions that reflect the beliefs, interests and cultural background of the translator
19 inimitability
translation type in which the translator renders not the actual words but an interpretation or paraphrase of its meanings. This presupposes that the meanings of the Qur’an are stable and accessible to the reader and do not differ from one translator to another. Reality, however, unravels differently when we notice the multitude of translations of the Qur’an in English alone and the enormous differences between them as to the content and approach followed in translation. An illustrative example is the great difference between The Qur’an by Saheeh International (1997) and Asad’s The Message of the Qur’an (1980).

In order to solve the complex problems in relation to sensitive religious issues that translators face in their tasks, it is advisable that an ID translation is followed.

3. Theoretical Framework

Today, ID approaches are gaining more and more ground in academic institutes due to a growing recognition that they represent a valuable, if not necessary tool, to answer complex questions whether in the field of sciences or humanities (Jones, 2009). While uni-disciplinary orientations remain the dominant trend in scientific research, new forms such as multidisciplinarity, trans-disciplinarity and supradisciplinarity are becoming more and more familiar. M.Modo and I. Kintchin (p.71) offer the following review about types of scientific research based on Rosenfels (1992) and Stokolos et al. (2008).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Orientation</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>uni-disciplinarity</td>
<td>A single discipline works together to address a common problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cross-disciplinarity</td>
<td>More than one discipline works side-by-side on related problems without involving each other to solve their problems. There is no attempt discourse with other disciplines and practitioners are confined with their discipline.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>multi-disciplinarity</td>
<td>More than one discipline work independently on a common problem. There is little commonality in terminology and methodology to address the common problem. Practitioners will only work within</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

20 A good example of recent scholars who adopt this view is Hussein Abdul-Raof (2001) in his work Qur’an Translation: Discourse, Texture and Exegesis
Klein and Newell define ID studies as:

A process of answering a question, solving a problem, or addressing a topic that is too broad or complex to be dealt with adequately by a single discipline or profession... and draws on disciplinary perspectives and integrates their insights through construction of a more comprehensive perspective (p. 393-394).

Klein identifies the profile of ID researchers underscoring the necessity of having “the skills of differentiating, comparing, contrasting, relating, clarifying, reconciling and synthesizing” (p.183) besides having the capacity to examine things from different perspectives. Further stressing the importance of synthesizing in ID studies and projects, C.Golding affirms that “While disciplinary depth is essential for investigating [...] complex issues, they also require what Howard Gardner calls a ‘synthesizing mind’” (2).
4. Hypothesis, Study Sample and Study Method

In this paper, I shall study the importance of an ID approach in the translation of religious canonical texts, taking the Qur'an as an example. In doing so, I have selected a corpus of two controversial issues the understanding of which, in one way or another, has an immediate profound impact on people’s social life. This concerns the issue of polygamy as exemplified by verses 3 and 129 of chapter 4 and the issue of Jihad as exemplified by verse 5 of chapter 9.

The hypothesis is that the issues of polygamy and Jihad, among others, represent complex problems that need an ID approach to be disentangled, a criterion that current translations of the Qur'an might not meet. The study is conducted against the background of the two tables below which summarize the disciplines thought to be important for the understanding of the verses in question.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Sub-discipline</th>
<th>Relation to the verses on polygamy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>linguistics</td>
<td>Parsing</td>
<td>• Relation between the imperative verb “Marry” and the free women and female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Sub-discipline</th>
<th>Relation to the verses on polygamy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>linguistics</td>
<td>Parsing</td>
<td>• Relation between the imperative verb “Marry” and the free women and female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Sub-discipline</td>
<td>Relation to understanding verse 9:5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| linguistics         | Text theory                     | • Understanding of the verse in the context of the verses preceding it and the verses following it in the same chapter  
|                     |                                 | • Understanding of the verse in the light of other verses and other                                    |

Table 2: Necessary disciplines and sub-disciplines to the understanding of verses 4: 3 and 4:129
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sciences of the Qur'an</th>
<th>Abrogating/abrogated verses</th>
<th>Need to settle the argument among exegetes of whether the verse is an abrogation of all the others preaching peace or not</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meccan/Medinian verses</td>
<td>Need to settle the argument of whether Meccan verses talked about Jihad or not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Re-examination of the sayings in the light of modern knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human sciences</td>
<td>History</td>
<td>Battle of Badr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Battles against Beni Qaynuqa/Beni Nadir / Beni Quraydha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>Is killing the best way to make non-believers embrace Islam?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Religious studies</td>
<td>Revival of Religious Sciences</td>
<td>New trends in viewing classical definitions of Religious Sciences like abrogation and Mukam/ Mutashabih</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3: Necessary disciplines and sub-disciplines to the understanding of verse 9:5

The thrust of the paper will be to describe five translations of verses 3 and 129 of chapter 4 and verse 5 of chapter 9. These are: First, The Quran by Saheeh International. Second, The Holy Quran by ‘Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali. Third, The Quran: A Reformist Translation by Edip Yüksel, Layth Salah al-Shaiban and Martha Schulte-Nafeh. Fourth, The Message of The Quran by Muhammed Asad. Finally, Le Coran: Essai de traduction by Jacque Berque. Each of these target language texts will be referred to by the abbreviation TLT affixed with the reference of its respective order in the study (i.e. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5) in superscript. This numerical order entails neither a chronological order of publication nor a sequential classification of translation quality. Within this perspective, I will endeavor to examine the discipline(s) taken into consideration by the translators and how these shape their understanding of the source text and subsequently its translation. To achieve this aim, I will study the translators’ insights into the problems raised by the two verses in relation to polygamy and the verse in relation to Jihad, will identify the types of relation between any disciplines used and will finally assess the degree of ID enlightenment the translator’s approach brings to the overall understood meaning of the verses. The parameters of the study will be examined through a scale that ranges from ‘none’ to ‘low’ to ‘medium’ and ‘high’. I will end the study by arguing the importance of an ID translation that has the benefit of better understanding the source text and better conveying its message to a target reader belonging to a different culture and will provide a conceptual framework for this.
### 5. Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verse</th>
<th>Translator</th>
<th>Insights into the problems raised by the verse</th>
<th>Integration of disciplines to surmount recognized problems</th>
<th>Pattern of ID interactions</th>
<th>Degree of ID mastery</th>
<th>Degree of ID understanding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q 4:3</td>
<td>TLT¹</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT²</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT³</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>high</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁴</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>high</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁵</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 4:129</td>
<td>TLT¹</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT²</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT³</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>high</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁴</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁵</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9:5</td>
<td>TLT¹</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT²</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT³</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁴</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>medium</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLT⁵</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>no interaction</td>
<td>low</td>
<td>low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: Findings about ID Integration into Qur’an Translation
6. Analysis

6.1. Analysis of the Translation of Verses about Polygamy

The Findings Table shows that TLT1 has no insights into the problems related to the two examined verses. The translation is in fact uni-disciplinary and offers no solutions to the problems in question. It remains a classical translation that offers no clarifications to the target reader concerning the issue of polygamy. What makes the translation likely to serve a particular political and sectarian agenda is that it is carried out under the broad umbrella of Saheeh International without specifying either the names of the translators or their background.

The two footnotes accompanying TLT2 reflect a ‘medium’ level of insights into the problems. The translator is indeed aware of some of the problematic aspects of the two verses mainly the conditional clause and the cause of revelation of verse 4:3. This explains the ‘medium’ level of the integration of disciplines. The degree if ID mastery remains ‘medium’ as the translator contents himself with referring to some disciplines without assuring any interaction between them. Consequently, the level of degree of ID understanding remains also ‘medium’ which explains the translator’s indecisiveness as to the issue of polygamy: While admitting that up to four wives are legally permitted, he recognizes the condition of equity and stresses that “it is almost impossible to fulfill”. However, he allows the possibility of polygamy should the concerned person want to indulge with the experience “on the hope that he might fulfill [the condition of equity]”. Although he declares that such a person would “put […] himself into that impossible position”, he encourages him to “fulfill all the outward duties that are incumbent on him in respect of her”.

In the case of TLT3, the Findings Table shows that the criterion of “Integration of disciplines” is ‘high’. This is explained by the translators’ recurrence to many disciplines in the footnote they propose to their translation. These include: parsing,
philology, semantics, sira\textsuperscript{21}, socio-religion, intercultural studies and comparative religion.

However, we notice no interaction between these disciplines which explains the ‘medium’ level for the remaining three criteria: Insights into the problems, degree of ID mastery and degree of ID understanding. This might also be attributed to the fact that the three translators have relied solely on referring to these disciplines without being experts in them; which has resulted in a number of problems within the translation offered: First, the translators’ view of polygamy remains unclear as they begin by restricting it to special conditions such as ”dramatic reduction in the male population during wartime” but end up declaring that “Those who could afford practicing polygamy, mentally and financially, should try hard to treat them equally, though 4:129 expresses the practical impossibility of attaining that ideal”. Second, the long reference to the issue of polygamy in Christianity and Judaism, as is presented, does not bring any enlightenment to the understanding of the verses. Third, although the philological explanation of the term ‘aymen’ in the Qur’anic verse “aw ma malaket aymanukum” is quite innovative and has nothing to do with “IBaD (slaves)” since “The practice of slavery was justified and resurrected to a certain extent via the influence of Jewish and Christian scholars, as well as fabricated hadith and shari’a laws, decades after Muhammad’s departure”, the analogy is not fully exploited to suggest for example that slavery was not openly condemned by the Qur’anic text which, however, encourages the liberating of slaves as in the case of not respecting one’s oaths\textsuperscript{22}. Finally, the reader feels, through the different disciplinary arguments the translators make use of, that they do not approve the idea of polygamy but their final decision remains unclear as they present many arguments against polygamy on the one hand and allow it on the condition of providing equality, a condition which they declare impossible to fulfill on the other hand.

The Findings Table shows that although the integration of disciplines in TLT\textsuperscript{4} is ‘high’ for the first verse in question, it remains ‘low’ in the case of the second verse. The lack of interaction in the ID pattern and the ‘medium’ and ‘low’ levels of insights.

\textsuperscript{21} Practices of prophet Mohamed
\textsuperscript{22} A broken oath could be expiated by feeding ten indigent persons or clothing them or freeing a slave according to chapter 5, verse 89
into the problems raised by the two verses respectively explain the ‘medium’ and ‘low’ levels of the degree of ID understanding and consequently the level of enlightenment it brings to the understanding of the two verses. Although the translator recurs to many a discipline in footnote\(^3\) that accompanies the translation of verse 4:3 such as parsing, semantics, pragmatics, philosophy, socio-biology, tafsir and practical sira of the prophet, he remains indecisive as to the legitimacy of polygamy. Indeed, although he includes many views from Islamic literature in the same footnote concerning this issue such as the explanations of ‘Aisha, of Bukhari, of Said Ibn Jubayr, of Qatada and of Tabari, he does not evaluate them in order to overcome the differences they might present; thus contenting himself with just being a reporter. Although he makes reference to Mohamed ‘Abduh’s understanding of the verse in the same footnote declaring that the implication of the verse is “irrespective of whether they are free women or, originally, slaves, the number of wives must not exceed four” corroborating this attitude by saying that “It was in this sense that Muhammad ‘Abduh understood the above verse (see Manar IV, 350)”, this does not solve the problem as many new interpretations are not in favor of polygamy\(^2\)\(^3\). Indeed, Mohamed Asad lacks a synthesizing mind and just opts for the simple and classical interpretation that the notion of equality among wives in the case of polygamy is restricted to material things and does not include the level of feelings, declaring that “while the spiritual problem of marriage, being imponderable and therefore outside the scope of law, is left to the discretion of the partners. In any event - since marriage in Islam is a purely civil contract - recourse to divorce is always open to either of the two partners”. In footnote\(^147\) to verse 4:129, the translator does not provide a clear answer as to whether polygamy should be permitted or not. He just concludes that the impossibility of equality stipulated by the verse refers only to a moral obligation and belongs only to the area of feelings. As a result, it can safely be deduced that he does not benefit too much of the disciplines he refers to in the footnotes which results in a ‘medium’ degree of understanding of the whole issue and the problems it raises.

In case of TLT\(^5\), the Findings Table shows a ‘medium’ level only at two criteria concerning verse 4: ‘Degree of insights into the problem’ and ‘Degree of ID

\(^{23}\) For more details, see the article ‘Polygamy’ in the Qur’an: an encyclopedia edited by Oliver Leaman
understanding’. All the remaining criteria for the two verses are ‘low’. The first striking thing about Berque’s translation is his use of the expression “alors épousez ce qui vous plaîra d’entre /Les femmes, par deux, ou trois ou quatre” (my emphasis) which means one can marry an unlimited number of wives on the condition that he does so by twos, threes or fours! Although the translator recognizes that polygamy is part of a past practice at a time women were considered to be weak and draws the reader’s attention to the link between verse 4 and 129 concerning the issue of equality declaring it to be impossible “Le doute exprimé ici, pudiquement, sur la possibilité de rester équitable, devient plus bas (v 129) une réaliste négation”, he does not provide a clear position towards the permissibility of polygamy although one senses that he is against this practice.

To sum up, the definition of ID provided by Klein and adopted in the theoretical framework section, does not apply to the five translations examined. TLT1 is easy to categorize as it does not show recurrence to any disciplines at all. Although the level of integration of disciplines in TLT3 and TLT4 is characterized as ‘high’, the two translations do not fall within the scope of the above definition as they are simply the product of linguists who refer to some disciplines without including them in the process of translation and consequently fail into having a ‘synthesizing mind’ that brings enlightenment to the question. Although TLT5 raises some problems about the understanding of the two verses and accuses exegetes of not being aware of them, it does not benefit a lot from the disciplines it makes use of and remains unclear as to unraveling the complexities of the issue of polygamy. Except for TLT1 which remains very orthodox in its orientation and recurs to no obvious disciplines, the other four translations include disciplines in the scope of their understanding the level of which is ‘medium’ in three cases and ‘high’ in one case. However, this does not meet the standards of ID and remains only a reference to disciplines without any interaction between the specialists of the different disciplines concerning the problem in question. As a result, the four translations do not delve deeply into the problem and fail to offer a translation that is clear in meaning to the target reader.
6.2. Analysis of the Translation of the Verse about Jihad

Although the ninth verse of the fifth chapter of the Qur’an is of paramount importance in shaping the Muslims’ relation to the unbelievers, only one out of the five translations examined has had a ‘high’ level of insights into the problems raised by the verse and yet is described as ‘medium’ at the levels of the disciplines used and the degree if ID awareness. Indeed, TLT¹ remains a word for word translation that is completely void of any ID usage. TLT², TLT³ and TLT⁵ share the same criteria. The insights into the problems raised by the verse are ‘low’ and the integration of disciplines is also ‘low’ resulting in a ‘low’ ID understanding of the verse. These four translations would corroborate into the target reader the already negative image the target culture holds about Islam as a terrorist religion.

Although TLT⁴ pleads for an interpretation of the verse in the light of other verses of the Qu’ran which preach peace and freedom of belief, its use of ID remains limited and consequently does not succeed well in establishing a convincing link between the idea of ceasing war against the unbelievers in case “they repent, and take to prayer [lit., "establish prayer"] and render the purifying dues” and the idea of religious freedom, contenting itself with explaining in a footnote that “[This] is no more than one, and by no means the only, way of their 'desisting from hostility’”.

7. Conclusion and Suggestions

“Translations,” according to Alavi (2012, p.26) “are inscribed forms of interpretation” and “religious intellectuals have availed themselves of hermeneutics among other theoretical apparatuses, to undermine the traditional methodology of Islamic jurisprudence and challenge the sole legitimacy of the clergy in interpreting the Qur’an as sacred scripture”. As such, ID has served a good analytical tool in this paper to legitimize or criticize some translation outputs.

The study of five different translations of two Qur’anic verses related to the issue of polygamy has revealed how exponents of classical theology (TLT¹) and reformist theology (TLT², TLT³ and TLT⁴) give two opposing understandings of the Qur’anic verses about polygamy. However, even among the reformist translations, views are not standard and the issue is not totally clarified. The different interpretations
examined may be due to many reasons: Complexity of the problem, ambiguity of some terms and structures and types of disciplines recurred to. While TLT\(^1\) adopts no disciplines in the translation process, the remaining translations differ in the type and number of disciplines they make use of. However, they all fail to meet the standards of ID as defined in the working definition adopted in this paper since they all rely on borrowing ideas from different disciplines instead of being themselves disciplinarians from different fields working together. This explains how the adoption of one meaning rather than another entails ideological attitudes towards the problem of polygamy.

The lack of ID awareness is more obvious in the case of the translation of the verse about Jihad where TLT\(^1\), TLT\(^2\), TLT\(^3\) and TLT\(^5\) share the same criteria of being merely a word for word translation with no recurrence to an ID understanding of the verse. Although TLT\(^4\) pleads for intertextuality and an understanding of the verse in the light of other verses, it remains limited in its recurrence to an ID approach. As a result, I propose a conceptual framework for a three-team interdisciplinary mega project of Qur’an translation in an attempt to overcome, or at least lessen, the degree of discrepancy in the understanding and translation of such disputed verses. The project is based on a framework of three teams working collaboratively at a micro level between members of the corresponding team and a macro level between the teams themselves as clarified in figure 1.
Instead of the usual translations such as the ones examined in this paper, which are either void of footnotes such as in the case of TLT\textsuperscript{1} or accompanied by lengthy footnotes that distract the reader’s attention, I propose a translation, the publication of which does not place the translation of the verses opposite the original scripture so as not to give the impression that this is a direct translation of it. Instead, the Arabic text should appear in the middle with a transliteration of it on one side and brief explanations of the final meanings of each verse agreed upon by the ID team on the other side. The whole translation should be accompanied by a separate volume that discusses in details the findings of the ID team and this should be done in accordance to a thematic classification rather than on the basis of the chronological order of the verses.
Although ID projects are difficult to manage and often result in communication problems among the project participants as stated by Golding (3) who asserts that “interdisciplinary subjects present multiple, and often conflicting, perspectives and ways of knowing”, they are deemed necessary for the translation of the Qu’ran should we want to overcome the contradictory opinions presented to the western target culture concerning sensitive issues such as the ones examined in this paper.

**Works Cited:**


About TAYR Quarterly

TAYR Quarterly (ISSN 2382-2872. Impact Factor 0.805) is an indexed journal that publishes all kinds of scientific research in English Language Literature, and Civilization conducted by young researchers from all over the globe. All articles, Research Letters, and papers published are reviewed by a committee of young researchers in the first phase and then edited by an eminent researcher. TAYR Quarterly is totally free and open access to all TAYR members.

TAYR Quarterly (TQ), a professional journal, encourages submission of previously unpublished articles on topics of significance to individuals concerned with English language teaching, learning, and research.

As a publication that represents a variety of cross-disciplinary interests, both theoretical and practical, TQ invites manuscripts on a wide range of topics, especially in the following areas:

- psychology and sociology of language learning and teaching
- issues in research and research methodology
- testing and evaluation
- professional preparation
- curriculum design and development
- instructional methods, materials, and techniques
- language planning professional standards

Because TQ is committed to publishing manuscripts that contribute to bridging theory and practice in our profession, it particularly welcomes submissions that address the implications and applications of research in, for example,

- anthropology
- applied and theoretical linguistics
- communication
- education
- English education, including reading and writing theory
- psycholinguistics
- psychology
- first and second language acquisition
- sociolinguistics
- sociology
TAYR QUARTERLY

TAYR Quarterly Board

Guest Editor:
Prof. Chokri Smaoui

Editor-in-Chief:
Dr. Mimoun Melliti

Editorial Board:
Dr. Yosra Amraoui
Dr. Ikram ben Arfi
Dr. Nadia Konstantini
Dr. Farhat Ben Amor

Reviewers:
A committee of young researchers specialized in different fields. More information concerning their expertise is available at www.tayrweb.org/#!/c3qn
Author Guidelines

All submissions to TQ should conform to the requirements of the Modern Language Association (MLA) or the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.), which can be obtained from the American Psychological Association. Per APA 6th edition, please note that DOIs are required in references and can be obtained at http://www.crossref.org/guestquery/.

TQ prefers that all submissions be written in a style that is accessible to a broad readership, including those individuals who may not be familiar with the subject matter.

TQ solicits manuscripts in four categories: Full-Length Articles, Research Letters (Brief Reports and Summaries), Research Issues, and Book Reviews. For the necessary submission items and other requirements, please see the category below for the article you intend to submit. Prospective authors are encouraged to read articles from the section to which they intend to submit to get an idea of the style and level of research required for publication.

TQ does not accept paper submissions. To submit you need to send a pdf version of your article to Mimoun Melliti tayr.tayr@gmail.com If a paper has more than one author, the person submitting the manuscript will have to identify the corresponding author and add the other authors. If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

To facilitate the double-blind review process, please remove the author’s name from the main text, the in-text citations, the reference list, and any running heads. Please replace the author’s name with Author. If there are multiple authors, please use Author1, Author2, etc. Manuscripts submitted without author’s name(s) removed will be returned without review for alteration and resubmission.

It is understood that manuscripts submitted to TQ have not been previously published and are not under consideration for publication elsewhere.

It is the author’s responsibility to indicate to the editor the existence of any work already published (or under consideration for publication elsewhere) by the author(s) that is similar in content to the submitted manuscript.

It is also the author’s responsibility to secure permission to reprint tables or figures that are used or adapted in the manuscript from another source. Written permission from the copyright holder is required before TAYR can publish the material. For more information on copyright permissions, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

The TQ editor reserves the right to make editorial changes in any manuscript accepted for publication to enhance clarity, concision, or style. The author will be consulted only if the editing has been substantial. The views expressed by contributors to TAYR Quarterly do not necessarily reflect those of the TQ editors, the Editorial Advisory Board, or TAYR committee members. Material published in TQ should not be construed as having the endorsement of TAYR.

All TQ authors may obtain a free final PDF offprint of their article--once the article has published online.

When evaluating a manuscript for publication in TQ, reviewers consider the following factors:

• The manuscript appeals to the general interests of TQ’s readership.
• The manuscript elucidates the relationship between theory and practice: Practical articles must be anchored in theory, and theoretical articles and reports of research must contain a discussion of implications or applications for practice.
Guidelines for submission

- The content of the manuscript is accessible not only to specialists in the area addressed but also to TQ’s broad readership.
- The manuscript offers a new, original insight or interpretation and not just a restatement of others’ ideas and views.
- The manuscript makes a significant (practical, useful, plausible) contribution to the field.
- The manuscript is likely to arouse readers’ interest.
- The manuscript reflects sound scholarship and research design with appropriate, correctly interpreted references to other authors and works.
- The manuscript is well written and organized and conforms to the specifications of the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.).

For accepted TQ papers, authors have the option of recording a short video abstract that will be accessible to readers via TAYR website and Facebook group. The article will retain its text abstract, but the video abstract will add another dimension and draw readers into an article in a new way.

TQ encourages authors to consider uploading their data collection materials to specialist repositories and databases and either citing or linking back to the primary research article. For example, IRIS is an online repository for data collection materials used for second language research. This includes data elicitation instruments such as interview and observation schedules, language tests and stimuli, pictures, questionnaires, software scripts, url links, word lists, teaching intervention activities, amongst many other types of materials used to elicit data. Please see http://www.iris-database.org for more information and to upload.

Any questions may be addressed to iris@iris-database.org.

Submission categories:

Full-Length Articles

Full length articles typically present empirical research and analyze original data that the author has obtained using sound research methods. TQ publishes both quantitative and qualitative studies. Occasionally, this section features reflective articles (i.e., think pieces) that provide a comprehensive review of current knowledge in a specific area and present significant new directions for research.

Manuscripts should be no more than 8,500 words, including reference, notes, and tables. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the article.

To submit a manuscript for a full-length article, please send a Word version of it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com. To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document to tayr.tayr@gmail.com:

- names and contact info for all authors
- cover letter
- abstract (200 words)
- manuscript (8,500 words)
- tables
- figures
- acknowledgments (if any)
Guidelines for submission

If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

**Forum**

TQ publishes four types of articles in the Forum:
- Commentaries from readers regarding current trends and practices in the English language research
- Responses to articles and reviews published in TQ
- Brief discussion of qualitative and quantitative research issues
- Brief discussions of teaching issues

Commentaries submitted to the Forum should generally be no longer than 3,400 words. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript.

Responses to articles should be no more than 1,500 words. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript. The article will be given to the author of the original article or review before publication for a reply that will be published with the response article. Unfortunately, TQ is unable to publish responses to previous exchanges.

To submit a manuscript to the Forum section, please send it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document:
- names and contact info for all authors
- cover letter
- manuscript (3,400 words for commentary; 1,500 words for a response)
- author bio(s)
- acknowledgments (if any)

If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

**Research Letters**

TQ also invites Research Letters (short reports) on any aspect of English research theory and practice. The editors encourage manuscripts that either present preliminary findings or focus on some aspect of a larger study. In all cases, the discussion of issues should be supported by empirical evidence, collected through qualitative or quantitative investigations. Research letters or summaries should present key concepts and results in a manner accessible to our diverse readership.

Submissions to this section should be no more than 3,400 words (including references, notes, and tables). Please indicate the number of words at the end of the research letter. Longer articles do not appear in this section and should be submitted to the full-length articles section.

To submit a manuscript to the Research Letters section, please send your work to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document:
- names and contact info for all authors
- cover letter
- manuscript (3,400 words)
- tables
- figures
- author bio(s)
Guidelines for submission

• acknowledgments (if any)
If you have questions about the submission process, please send an email to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.

Research and Teaching Issues
Contributions to Research and Teaching Issues are typically solicited. The editors pose a question concerning a salient issue in research or teaching and invite someone in the field to write an answer. Readers may send topic suggestions or make known their availability as contributors by writing directly to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.
Contributions to Research or Teaching Issues should be no more than 3,400 words, including tables, figures, and notes, and references. Please indicate the number of words at the end of the manuscript.
If you have been invited to submit a manuscript, send it to tayr.tayr@gmail.com.
To facilitate the submission process, please send the following items in a separate word document to tayr.tayr@gmail.com:
• names and contact info for all authors
• cover letter
• manuscript (3,400 words)
• tables
• figures
• author bio(s)
• acknowledgments (if any)
If you have questions about the submission process, please contact tayr.tayr@gmail.com.